



MSP Stakeholder Workshop

Workshop #4

Wednesday April 22 2015

0900-1630 hrs.

Location: STC Conference Room

Minutes

Meeting Objectives:

1. To provide an update on the Seychelles Marine Spatial Planning (MSP) Initiative.
2. To provide an update on data layers, planning tools, and development of stakeholder preferences for zoning.
3. To receive stakeholder input on draft zoning design scenarios.

Attendance:

Mr. Alain Decomarmond
Ms. Alice Mascarenas
Ms. Amanda Padayachy
Mr. Andrew Grieser-Johns
Mr. Arthur de Bretagne
Mr. David Rowat
Mr. Denniel Martin
Dr. Dolor Ernesta
Dr. Frauke Dogley
Mr. Gilberte Gendron
Ms. Helena Sims
Mr. Herve Barois
Mr. James Mougale
Mr. Jan Robinson
Dr. Jeanne Mortimer
Ms. Joanna Prosper
Dr. Joanna Smith
Mr. Johnny Louys
Mr. Julian Clifton
Ms. Katy Beaver
Mr. Lindsay Chong-Seng
Mr. Line Mancienne
Mr. Louis Desnousse
Ms. Marie-Angel Thomas
Mr. Patrick Samson
Mr. Pierre-Andre Adam
Mr. Rodney Quatre
Mr. Roger Denousse
Mr. Sonny Naiken

Ms. Venessa Quatre
Mr. Wills Agricole

Minutes

Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
Welcome	By Principal Secretary WA for Energy and Climate Change	
Agenda	Agenda was adopted.	
Summary of debt buy-back and trust	Gave a summary of the debt buy-back.	
Updates	Interim MSP product to be presented on 6 th May 2015 to the Cabinet of Ministers.	
Updates	Further stakeholder consultation June 9 th -17 th 2015.	
Updates	SC meeting scheduled for 23 rd April 2015 postponed to a later date as the shorter end of April deadline has been extended.	
Updates	Is it important to note that the fish resources in the EEZ are a main pillar of the economy. Will the plan be legislated for?	J.S. responded this will be a legal plan. Implementation and development to be carried out in Phase 2. Reviews will be carried out after 12, 14 and 60 months as per best international practices.
Introduction of Participants		
Sector Updates	Queried the lack of representation of FBOA in the workshop	Mr. David Bowat responded most of the members are in Belgium currently over EU contract negotiation. J.S. responded they are members of the SC and TWG and were also invited to attend this workshop.
Sector Updates	The final products of the Marxan analysis for Zone B are being uploaded via dropbox and should be ready by the end of the day to be sent to TNC.	
Overview of MSP Governance Framework	Gave an overview of the Governance Framework	
The MSP Overview and Update	Gave an overview of the MSP progress and updates.	
The MSP Overview and Update	Need to be careful not to divert from the original vision when using the iterative approach.	J.S. Responded the reviews need to be carried out in the context of the vision.
The MSP Overview and Update	The review plan is essential to allow for sustainable exploitation.	
The MSP Overview and Update	Research is essential to make informed decisions for reviews. A key example is the Aldabra management plan where research	

Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
	has shown that expansion of the MPA boundary is key.	
Industrial Fishing	Reviews need to be carried out at the same time of the review/negotiation of fishery EU agreements. Current actual value of industrial fishery being approximately 60m USD/year. Any displacement of the industrial fishing fleet will affect Port Victoria and the Seychelles in general.	J.S. Responded with a request for SFA to share these agreements with TNC.
Industrial Fishing	All implications of the MSP need to be assessed before it becomes legally binding. E.g. affect EU fishery agreements.	
Industrial Fishing	With the decrease in the level of finance provided through the debt swap from USD80 million to 30, which now makes only USD 400,000 per year available compared to the USD 1.9m per year that had been previously agreed, will the area of 30% PA be renegotiated? Are the funds now feasible for the management of 30% of the EEZ?	J.S. to follow up.
Industrial Fishing	The actual value of the fishery is \$60 million USD annually, and any displacement of the industrial fishing fleet will affect Port Victoria and the economy.	J.S. responded by requesting documentation of from SFA on the value of the industrial fisheries.
Industrial Fishing	It is important that an economic and financial analysis is carried out alongside the development of the Seychelles MSP. The Seychelles community needs to be briefed fully and appraise the plan.	J.S. to follow up.
MSP Principles to Guide Decision	A paper was recently published on marine policy (Hugh Goven?) with the development of a set of guiding principles developed for plans not be perceived as ocean grabbing. SFA to circulate.	
MSP Principles to Guide Decision	Include best international practices in the principles to guide decisions.	
Integration of Law and Policy into MSP	Need to consider the Aquaculture Masterplan by the SFA	
1030 Coffee Break		
Zoning and the MSP Matrix	Sport fishing is currently in two zones, A & E. Should it not be in only zone A?	Mr. Jan Robinson responded this should not matter as it will be governed by one act (the fisheries act) regardless of which zone(s) it is in.
Zoning and the MSP Matrix	Does the Marxan output used for Zone B include the cost, constraints and opportunities?	J.S. responded once the final outputs are received from the GoS-UNDP-GEF PA Project, we can discuss this further.

Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
Zoning and the MSP Matrix	Is there any scientific justification as to the percentage area of habitat that needs to be protected?	J.S. responded justification for species exists and is currently 30%. Species area curves also state 30%. H.S. responded the percentage area for each habitat type comes consultation and recommendations from the expert workshop that was carried out (PA Project).
Alternative Zoning Option: Definition of No Take	The oceanic forbidden fruit.	
Alternative Zoning Option: Definition of No Take	Aldabra is a no-take zone but subsistence fishing for management occurs.	
Alternative Zoning Option: Definition of No Take	International best practices can be used for guidance here. E.g. Australia allows extraction in MPAs for subsistence and management/research.	J.S. to respond.
Alternative Zoning Option: Definition of No Take	There is a greater need here to focus on what is meant by 'take' and the compatible uses in these areas. E.g.; hotels, catch and release also need to be considered.	Mr. Andrew Grieser-Johns responded A compatibility matrix has already been developed and defines what is allowed in the different categories of no-take zones.
Alternative Zoning Option: Definition of No Take	Need to align the definition with the endorsed PA policy.	J.S. to respond.
Alternative Zoning Option: Definition of No Take	Suggests there should be no impact activities.	J.S. to respond.
Alternative Zoning Option: Definition of No Take	Suggests that there are no aquaculture, semi-industrial and industrial fishing in no-take areas.	J.S. to respond.
Alternative Zoning Option: Definition of No Take	This would then exclude hotels (e.g. in the outer islands).	Dr. Frauke Dogley responded that the PA policy lists and defines different categories. One category allows for sustainable use, under which some hotels could fall.
Alternative Zoning Option: Definition of No Take	The definition of no-take should also consider and align with the fisheries act.	H.S. responded all national policies and commitments will need to be considered and aligned to (hence the importance of consultancy being carried out by Ms. Iris Carolus).
Alternative Zoning Option: Definition of No Take	Catch and release still impacts on the resource and care needs to be taken when restricting artisanal fishermen from an area but allowing for other impact activities.	

Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
Alternative Zoning Option: Definition of No Take	This is where an analysis of the socio-economic impacts is key. Stakeholders are going to be directly impacted by such a plan and hence need to be involved.	
Alternative Zoning Option: Definition of No Take	Not here to define the no-take zone. The definition needs to be in line with the PA Policy, fisheries act and IUCN. We should not create new definitions.	
Alternative Zoning Option: Definition of No Take	PAs in Seychelles have existed for a number of years and we should use their criteria to develop definitions and allowable uses for MSP.	J.S. to respond.
Alternative Zoning Option: Definition of No Take	The PA Policy and PAs in Seychelles define the no-take and allowable uses through management plans and the regulations and they normally do not allow for fishing.	
Alternative Zoning Option: Definition of No Take	The existing MPAs are only 0.04% of the EEZ and are not effectively managed. Main concern is how this 15% no-take is going to be policed and managed.	J.S. responded The use of satellite technology can be used to assist with this. No-take is easier than sustainable use as effectively no harvesting is allowed in no-take.
Alternative Zoning Option: Definition of Sustainable Use	Suggest to go through the handouts prepared already to assist in formulating a definition (table).	J.S. to follow up.
Alternative Zoning Option: Definition of Sustainable Use	The term sustainable use zone suggests that all other activities in other zone are unsustainable. Propose biodiversity multiple use zone.	J.S. to follow up.
Alternative Zoning Option: Definition of Sustainable Use	Suggests to include all current managed fisheries under the sustainable use area.	J.S. to follow up.
Alternative Zoning Option: Definition of Sustainable Use	Could one then say any area with a management plan is sustainable use?	
Alternative Zoning Option: Definition of Sustainable Use	There is currently no management plan for the Mahé Plateau/EEZ and IOTC. However, harvest control rules by the IOTC can be a mechanism for management (fishery of a particular stock in a particular way). For sustainable use on this scale we can address the country FAD management plan.	
Alternative Zoning Option: Definition of Sustainable Use	A management plan is not specific.	
Draft Zoning Design and Activities Table	Can have one table that applies to all areas (e.g. GBR) or one table per area (e.g. California).	
Draft Zoning Design and Activities Table	How can we enforce the disposal and dumping?	J.S. responded if it is close to the coast then it can be enforced, but it

Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
		would be challenging for other areas.
Draft Zoning Design and Activities Table	In the compatibility matrix, no take and industrial fishing and aquaculture are clearly incompatible but the table proposed makes it conditional.	J.S. responded that the table looks at each area in more detail and activities can be conditional per area but if stakeholders think it is incompatible we can put a clear X here.
Draft Zoning Design and Activities Table	The national parks are already existing and do not allow dredging but the table is considering these activities and this is worrying. One also needs to consider the scale.	J.S. responded this has been included as some jetty/pier may be required for access in national parks. In this case recommends separate table for sensitive areas.
Draft Zoning Design and Activities Table	Ferries and shipping lanes are in no-take and so are yacht charter/sailing activities. Has the capacity been considered? Maybe state conditional for these activities in no-take? Non-motorised recreation also needs to be conditional.	J.S. to respond.
Draft Zoning Design and Activities Table	Need to consider the scale of the plan which is much larger than existing MPAs which are small, but can make use of experiences from management of existing PAs.	J.S. to respond.
Draft Zoning Design and Activities Table	The scales are very different and hence most of the existing management tools and principles will not apply for the MSP.	
Lunch 1230-1330hrs		
New Zone Options April 2015 Areas Proposed		
Area 1 Mahé Plateau	Need to consider potential future uses such as increased number of cruise ships and hence increased demand for food and increased waste.	J.S. to follow up.
Area 1 Mahé Plateau	Prefers the word multi-use to economic use. Ms. Joanna Prosper agrees.	J.S. to follow up.
Area 1 Mahé Plateau	There is currently no part of the plateau that is a biodiversity priority area. Areas proposed for biodiversity protection include the Southern area down towards the Mascarene ridge, but this needs to be overlaid with VMS data first to investigate use conflicts. Also need to consider what habitats have not been captured in the zones already.	J.S. to follow up.
Area 1 Mahé Plateau	The proposed area by Mr. Rowat is not listed in the priority area.	
Area 1 Mahé Plateau	As per the fisheries policy, the Mahé plateau excludes industrial fisheries and may be considered as a sustainable use area.	J.S. to follow up.

Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
Area 1 Mahé Plateau	What has Marxan been asked to identify and why has it not picked up priority areas on the plateau?	J.S. responded we need consultation to identify these priorities.
Area 1 Mahé Plateau	If this process is being selected then a greater consultation with fishermen is needed because some islands such as Bird Island are used in the SE monsoon for shelter.	J.S. to follow up.
Area 1 Mahé Plateau	Need to understand the Marxan model and how it selects areas. The model will penalise if there are large areas of similar habitat. Therefore as Jan suggested, good to look at areas that we know are high biodiversity and low overlap with other uses.	Mr. Rick Tingey responded Dr. Klaus did take these factors into account when running the model (homogenous habitat + stratification)
Area 1 Mahé Plateau	Agrees that more of the Mahe Plateau needs to be protected.	
Area 2 north Drop-off	This area does not include Denis Island.	J.S. responded it can be included if needed.
Area 2 north Drop-off	This is the only part of the plateau with reef and land and hence the only refuge for artisanal fishermen when the sea is rough.	J.S. to follow up.
Area 2 north Drop-off	If this is the only fishery area in the SE monsoon then technically we cannot declare it a no-take.	J.S. to follow up.
Area 2 north Drop-off	Under the ecological reserves category of a PA Policy the areas can be seasonal/temporal. This can be applied in this area but need to determine the peak time for cetacean in the area for conservation.	J.S. to follow up.
Area 2 north Drop-off	Even if the cetacean season overlaps there is no big impact/conflict with the artisanal fishery.	
Area 2 north Drop-off	This area can be made bigger than currently presented if it is temporal.	J.S. to follow up.
Area 2 north Drop-off	The area's designation can change between sustainable use and no-take, but wider consultation is needed.	J.S. to follow up.
Area 3 South Drop-off and Platte	What is the feedback on connecting this area to a no-take area on the plateau?	
Area 3 South Drop-off and Platte	Although it is important to look at the fishing pressure (some areas in the plateau have little fishing pressure), often an area with low fishing pressure indicated low biodiversity.	
Area 3 South Drop-off and Platte	Is this area a shelter area in the South as is Bird in the North?	Mr. Jan Robinson responded less than Bird in the North, but need to separate VMS data by season to determine this.

Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
Area 3 South Drop-off and Platte	In terms of connectivity, could shift the area to the lower Southern Area of the Plateau in a South Eastern direction. What is the current area used for?	Mr. Jan Robinson responded this area was traditionally used for deep slope fishery. But because the area is further away there is less economic return. The fishermen have reduced their trips to the area. The strong currents over Constant bank leads to less drift fishing.
Area 4 Cerf Ridge	Not much purse seine on this side as predominant current is East to West and hence drift gear would go onto land areas. Hence this area can be a sustainable use in terms of no fads being used here.	
Area 5 Coetivy and Fortune Bank	Need to determine if there are incompatibilities with this area and the EU fisheries agreement.	J.S. responded there are currently no potential incompatibilities, but the zone boundaries need to be determined first.
Area 5 Coetivy and Fortune Bank	Need to look at EIU protocol and see if this can be a sustainable use area with industrial fisheries but lower extraction.	J.S. responded the current wording of the agreement is broad.
Area 6 Amirantes East	Proposed future uses include sustainable use under the outer islands project with Poivre having a 1Km boundary from the reef flat.	
Area 6 Amirantes East	This area is important for turtles and seagrass beds.	
Area 6 Amirantes East	Ensuring this area is a no-take zone will be very costly as there is a high number of activities and use in this area.	
Area 6 Amirantes East	Enforcement may be feasible if delegated to management entities of surrounding islands such as D'Arros Island.	
Area 7 Amirantes Group (African Banks)	Desnoeufs is a primary area for harvesting of seabird eggs and hence cannot be a no-take zone.	
Area 7 Amirantes Group (African Banks)	Area 7 is better as sustainable use. The practicality to manage this area as it is far from Mahe needs to be thought of as it will be a high cost.	J.S. responded could potentially split Area 7 into sustainable use and economic use. Need to follow up.
Area 7 Amirantes Group (African Banks)	Boudeuse is very important for Boobies and Marie-Louise and Etoile are important for Roseate terns. Desnoeufs is important for sooty terns. All these seabirds interact highly with the fish populations in the area.	J.S. to follow up.
Area 7 Amirantes Group (African Banks)	There is a high irreplaceability count in the North Area of the African Banks and this area is not included as a high industrial fishery area. It could hence be a sustainable use area.	

Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
Area 7 Amirantes Group (African Banks)	What is the reason for high biodiversity in this area?	J.S. responded there is a high diversity of habitats with seamounts at the top of the trench.
Area 7 Amirantes Group (African Banks)	Propose to enlarge Area 7 or extend the Mahe Plateau Area 1 to include this area.	J.S. to follow up. Need to do an economic analysis here as there is high fishing activity in this area.
Area 7 Amirantes Group (African Banks)	This area is also a high navigation use.	
Area 7 Amirantes Group (African Banks)	Seeing as Area 7 is already suggested as economic use, we could extend Area 7.	J.S. to follow up.
Area 7 Amirantes Group (African Banks)	Though it is suggested that it is lower fishery pressure in the Amirantes group, there will be a high impact on fishermen (artisanal, charter) and high potential loss of use.	
Area 7 Amirantes Group (African Banks)	Suggests to consult highly with the IDC for this zone.	J.S. to follow up.
Area 8 Alphonse Group	Not much has been discovered about the trench.	
Area 8 Alphonse Group	Not all trenches should be treated equal.	
Area 8 Alphonse Group	Fly-fishing and catch and release have some impacts on the marine environment and this needs to be addressed if this area is a no-take zone.	J.S. to follow up.
Area 8 Alphonse Group	There is already a limit on the number of rods used in this area.	J.S. to follow up.
Area 8 Alphonse Group	If this area was sustainable use it would make the activities in this area more compatible.	J.S. to follow up.
Area 9 Farquhar Group Inner	The seagrass area between Providence and Cerf was proposed to be a no-take zone in the last TWG by Mr. Jude Bijoux.	J.S. responded the area was initially all zoned as no-take but was then changed to sustainable use.
Area 9 Farquhar Group Inner	To keep people around the islands, one would need some form of ongoing economic activity as you need to give a value to the effort of going to this outer island group. Hence, no take is not advisable.	J.S. to consider.
Area 9b	Need input from the industrial fishery for this area.	
Area 9b	For precise feedback from the industrial fishery, a more precise map would need to be presented with justifications and economic impact evaluation.	J.S. to follow up.
Area 9b	It is recommended to overlay oceanographic data especially current flow on the map (industrial fishery) to determine where gear is set. The displacement of vessels will depend on current flow.	J.S. to follow up.
Area 9b	The oceanographic layer would need to be separated by seasons (monsoons).	J.S. to follow up.

Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
Area 9b	The design of 9a/9b needs to be reconsidered. Managing a sustainable use area enclosed by a no-take zone would be very difficult.	J.S. responded with a suggestion to split the area into sustainable use/no-take by North to South or East to West.
Area 10 Aldabra	There is high fly-fishing activity in Cosmoledo and Astove. Hence closing this area to artisanal fishermen will not be well received if fly-fishing activities are ongoing. This applies mostly to seacucumber and red snapper (bottom fishing) fisheries.	J.S. to follow up.
Area 10 Aldabra	The area is managed by different entities (SIF, IDC, military). How would the area be enforced?	J.S. responded Management authorities, implications of the plan will be discussed in Phase 2.
Area 11 Aldabra North	This area is a free school fishing area (using birds to indicate presence of tuna). Hence, FADS are not used here. With FADS there is a higher level of by-catch unlike when setting on seabirds.	
Area 11 Aldabra North	This area is again very far from the main islands and difficult to manage.	
Area 12 Everywhere Else	Is there any key area not selected in the EEZ?	
Area 12 Everywhere Else	The trench area is not represented.	
Area 12 Everywhere Else	The Mahe Plateau will soon have a management plan, hence, why is this area not called sustainable use?	J.S. to follow up, but responded There is no prioritisation of activities in this plan. The proposed economic area includes all activities.
Area 12 Everywhere Else	The use of the word sustainable contradicts with the biodiversity objective. Would be better to call the area multiple-use.	J.S. responded by proposing 'reserve' instead of 'sustainable use'.
Area 12 Everywhere Else	If using the definition of sustainable use proposed, there is no point in zoning an area as sustainable use as the only activity that is forbidden is the extraction of coal and minerals and in the activities table mining and petroleum is conditional.	J.S. to follow up.
Area 12 Everywhere Else	Whatever wording is used, it needs to be a structure that anyone can understand inherently. E.g. the wording no-take upsets fishermen and hence better to use a different term such as high biodiversity zone.	J.S. to follow up.
Area 12 Everywhere Else	It took Seychelles three years to develop a Protected Areas (PA) policy and the process included the revision of IUCN criteria to fit the Seychelles' scenarios. The MSP ideally needs 30% of some form of protected area listed under this PA policy. Need to be careful that the MSP is not setting up	J.S. to follow up.



Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
	another system. It needs to align with existing laws and policies of Seychelles.	
Area 12 Everywhere Else	The biodiversity areas under this design should fall under protected areas and/or fisheries regulations. The areas identified represent 28% of the Seychelles EEZ. How these are defined and managed can be done in Phase II of the MSP.	
Workshop Adjourned 1610hrs.		

Minutes Submitted by: Helena E. Sims

Annex I: Meeting Agenda

MSP Stakeholder Engagement

Meeting 4

22 April 2015

9:00 AM – 4:30 PM

Location: STC Conference Room

Agenda

Meeting Objectives:

1. To provide an update on the Seychelles Marine Spatial Planning (MSP) Initiative.
2. To provide an update on data layers, planning tools, and development of stakeholder preferences for zoning.
3. To receive stakeholder input on draft zoning design scenarios.

Agenda Item #	Time	Agenda Topic
1	9:00 AM	Welcome and Opening <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Welcome from Ministry of Environment, Energy and Climate Change • Introductions • Agenda review
2	9:15 AM	Seychelles Marine Spatial Planning (MSP) Initiative Update <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Update on Seychelles Debt Swap • Updates on MSP process: timelines, workshops, and outputs • Roundtable by participants for sector updates and information
	10:15 AM	Tea Break
3	10:30 AM	Data layers, planning tools and integrated stakeholder preferences <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Spatial Layers for all zone types • Compatibility Matrix and other tools • Integrated Stakeholder Preferences for Zones A, D, C and E
4	11:30 AM	Seychelles Draft Zoning Design Scenarios <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scenarios, compatible uses and management considerations
	12:15 PM	Lunch
	1:15 PM	Seychelles Draft Zoning Design Scenarios, cont'd
	3:00 PM	Tea Break
	3:15 PM	Seychelles Draft Zoning Design Scenarios, cont'd
5	4:15 PM	Wrap Up and Next Steps
	4:30 PM	Adjourn