



MSP Stakeholder Workshop

Workshop #5

Tuesday 9 June 2015

8:30 AM – 4:00 PM

Location: ICCS Room 2

ICCS - International Conference Centre of Seychelles

Minutes

Meeting Objectives:

1. To provide an update on the Seychelles Marine Spatial Planning (MSP) Initiative.
2. To receive input on the preliminary zoning design for Seychelles EEZ and discuss activities tables and “no take” areas.

Attendance:

Alain de Comarmond
Arjan de Groene
Lindsay Chong-Seng
Herve Barois
Miguel Herrera
Amit Wasserberg
Pierre-Andre Adam
Ronley Fanchette
Emmanuel Chassot
Roy Clarisse
Vincent Lucas
Roger Desnousse
Louis Desnousse
Ronny Renaud
Elissa Socrate
Calvin Gerry
Allen Chetty
Ned Wirtz
Olivier Bodere
Virginie Lagarde
Keith Andre
Martin Dernier
Julie Low
Andrew Charles
Joanna Prosper
Cynthia Adrienne
Chris Mason-Parker
Rowana Walton
David Rowat

Frauke Fleischer-Dogley
 Denis Reiss
 Anertz Minuatera
 Michel Goujon
 Denis Rais
 Grant Hyer
 Rondolph Payet
 Joanna Smith
 Helena Sims

Minutes

Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
Agenda	Agenda was reviewed and adopted.	
Stakeholder Intros and Roundtable Sector Updates	Requested to have more background and purpose on meetings and where to go from here.	J.S. responded updates on how maps are developed will be provided shortly. The revisions are then brought to the SC and make recommendations on the final design. This then goes to Ministerial level. Any recommendations for additional analyses need to be made today.
Stakeholder Intros and Roundtable Sector Updates	New areas have been proposed. Information received last few weeks is different and worked on old version. Where have the new areas come from?	J.S. responded The MSP initiative is very rapid. Version 2 changes as some areas are larger because of the 30% protection goal of government. Used feedback from last workshop to revise the zoning design and was finalized last week. All feedback is welcome from last version as can still be used to refine version 2.0.
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	Presented a refresh of the Seychelles MSP initiative; goals and vision of Seychelles MSP, outcomes. Marxan reserve design & ecological theory.	
<i>1000 hrs coffee break</i>		
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	Presentation continued on high biodiversity areas, compatible uses, economic uses and sustainable use.	
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	Mention that for the Mahe plateau that it will be refined in Phase 2.	

Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	If 30% have achieved with areas, how to add zone 1 and 2 in other phase – will there be an allowance to look at other areas?	J.S. responded will remove from other areas, it will not be higher than 30%.
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	Initially it was mentioned it will be up to 30%. Can these percentages be revised and what is the minimum total protection?	J.S. responded up to 30%. Minister Adam requires 30% for the Debt Swap.
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	1) Is there a rationale for the 15% no take? 2) Exclusion area for the purse seiners already represent 9% and start from this for zone 2. 3) Zone B is sustainable use and zone 3 is economic zone. All areas need to be sustainable and needs to apply to whole EEZ.	J.S. responded A: On sustainable issue this has been raised in the past. The zone 2 is referring to ecological, sustainability. Zone 1 and zone 2 primary objectives is around biodiversity. The restricted areas apply only to the industrial fisheries hence it is not a complete no take area.
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	Problem being these areas looking at sustainability and looking at Tuna which are highly migratory species (IOTC) hence the MPS on these species. Revenue from debt swap and loss of revenue from industrial fisheries needs to be looked at.	J.S. responded A: An economic impact analysis will be carried out in phase 2.
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	No take areas already exist for Industrial fisheries. This avoids conflict between industrial and artisanal fisheries. But, do you need a no-take for everyone in one area. What targets are you meeting? If it is no take for fisheries it should also be for every other use, e.g. petroleum, development etc...	J.S. responded A: Very few countries have large IUCN IA categories where everyone is excluded. Need to go through each zone and what would be allowed. This needs to be consistent with the objective of the area. Uses have to match the objective. Map Area 2a & 2b – allows 30% representation zone for upwelling
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	These 2 zones are very important for semi-industrial and artisanal fishery. All shallow water areas have been demarcated off and will have a huge impact on the artisanal fisheries. If seasonal would need to close it off season and open peak season and hence what is the point of this zone. The high BD area (zone 1) certain activities will be allowed but this will be unfair as some will be allowed to make money out of conservation while others will be excluded. E.g. hotels and resorts are	J.S. responded these activities are non-extractive and hence are allowed. But conditional to management plans.

Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
	allowed in zone 1, motorized activity; Jet Ski and powerboats.	
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	Asked if an area is no-take, then everyone should be excluded? This is IUCN IA.	Some responses from stakeholders in following comments.
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	In response to J.S. this question is pertinent, if the person is being excluded in one part, e.g. fisheries, what is the alternate livelihood of these activities if they are restricted in these areas.	No response required.
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	As per Keith's comment. E.g. zone 1 the rationale of allowing motorized act but not shipping and allows anchoring and moorings. These activities don't make sense. As per the Mahe plateau MP, restricting fishermen on Plateau and promoting fishing on drop-off. Area 2a and 2b will impact the management plan negatively.	No response required.
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	In reference to zone 1, at the earlier stages, and came to a consensus that zone 1 would be more for research activities and conservation. Activities need to be allowed to enable this.	J.S. responded A: This comment was made in August and would have different scales of protection in zone 1.
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	If an area is closed to a fishermen, they will move the effort and fish somewhere else (displacement) hence, the problem is not solved. Also, fishermen not against closing an area, but closing to other activities. There needs a rationale to closing the area. There is no rationale in the table. Areas overlap with 0 uses for industrial. What are the impact numbers meanings?	J.S. responded A: Used the 10 year mean of CPUE. Tuna are high migratory species with very high variability in CPUE. The average should not be used as they are not representative.
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	Need to consider the fishing zones are fishing opportunities as per the agreements between the EU fisheries and Gov. of Seychelles. The rationale of the agreement is for no interaction between industrial fisheries and artisanal fisheries. Highest objectives	No response required.

Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
	being sustainability for Industrial fisheries.	
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	In terms of zone 1. Have to acknowledge that nature conservation can only occur if you have a budget. Generation of funds is key for this and needs to be considered. Since 2008 the government has taken a new direction and PA managers needs to generate their own funds to operate, hence needs to allow some type of activity of one type to generate these funds.	J.S. to respond.
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	In zone 1 especially RE sport and fly fishing, there will need to be allowances for the hotels to continue these activities in the area. At the same point it cannot be a restriction on other sport vessels that carry out the same activity.	No response required.
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	For zone 1 idea is to follow the PA Policy to look at allowable uses.	No response required.
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	The date provided by SSFC are now deemed as no-take and are the large areas for sports fishing. Activity list places an X next to sports fishing as not allowable. Need to re-look at allowable uses in these zones.	No response required.
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	Following Minister Decomarmond's comment on no-take. Cosmoledo and Astove is primary fly-fishing. How is this in zone 1? This does not match the Ministry's objective.	J.S. to respond.
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	Map area 5 cannot only be 3% of the EEZ. Please re-check. It should be bigger.	J.S. to respond.
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	Providence is the last area left for sport fishing vessels. If no-take there will be area for the industry left. Needs to allow fly fishing.	J.S. to respond.
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	For Area 10 Aldabra group, there are no existing layers/info for safe havens.	No response required.

Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	Information will be sent for the impact for purse seiners as disagrees with most figures presented. The MSP presented is not equitable for the fishermen. Ecologically difference between industrial and benthic fisheries. Pelagic fleets already excluded in area 8 and 9. Need to differentiate between pelagic and demersal ecosystems.	J.S. to respond.
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	Area 8 & 9 are one of the best sports and fly fishing destination in the world. Would like to have these activities continued in this location.	J.S. to respond.
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	If an area has fallen into zone 1 and there is a hotel in that area and activities not as per zone. What will happen to the hotel? If so there will be compensation. Will there be compensation be provided to fishermen for loss of livelihood.	J.S. to respond.
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	According to the EU, such consultation with stakeholders is not the appropriate forum and as this is government led, joined committee meetings is where these plans need to be consulted. Has Seychelles already carried out an impact assessment on this MSP with the existing agreements signed with fisheries? Next step being an economic impact assessment and when will this be carried out?	MEECC responded they still in stakeholder consultation process and if feels a separate process is needed, this can be discussed and brought forward to foreign affairs. J.S. responded once the zoning design is more final and not changing so much, then the impact assessment can be carried out.
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	Many of these areas around various islands, e.g. area 10, Cosmoledo and Astove, if list of allowable activities, then can re-define this zone around these islands as Astove & Cosmoledo has opened for tourism activities. Some Semi-industrial fisheries are also ongoing in these zones. Also area 14 around Coetivy and mariculture activities around there.	No response needed.
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	Also feel uncomfortable to discuss on these areas as do not have information on these areas currently. Also the economic information is key to even consider the areas that are selected	J.S. to respond.

Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
	hence having the economic information later is not the best approach.	
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	Public announcement for Debt Swap is in December and need to elucidate from Gov. what is expected by July 2015.	
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	Have concerns for zone 8, 9, 10, 11 (South) see a danger of opening these areas in the South to other nationalities if excluding Seychellois from these areas. Need solid protection to guard these areas.	J.S. to respond.
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	For economic data (which is very sensitive information) it will be very useful to balance the use for different zones. Any information on economics and retention of revenue in the country. Need to consider the social dimension of these activities.	J.S. to follow up.
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	Most high use areas are currently zoned at high use areas (sports and artisanal) hence may need to change these areas to managed areas not closed as will have a high impact in these areas. Less socio-economic impact. Joanna Smith; Fine scale planning to be carried out in phase 2.	
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	Monitoring by satellite costs a lot of money. As France is carrying his out in Austral Area. The cost may be more than the value of the fish in the EEZ. There are vessels in the EEZ that can participate in this strategy. Purse seiners have observers on board and can be made conditional to manage the MSP. Fishermen can contribute to research and monitoring. Excluding them will be detrimental to the plan. Difficulty to understand the way to proceed particularly looking at area 8 & 9 which have same impact for birdlife but area 9 higher use for fishermen. Need to decide on the no-take. Need to define what is zone 1. It is not necessarily no-take. As presenting as 15% no take and	J.S. responded some activities are very fine scale and will be captured in the activities table.

Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
	15% sustainable use. These zones are not parallel.	
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	e.g. area 8 & 9. How did you end up with a straight line and much larger than the high biodiversity area from the Marxan analysis?	J.S. responded originally areas were in zone 1 and after consultation, then separated into 2 to allow for uses and used bathymetry to separate these 2 areas.
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	Now understand rational to cut for artisanal fisheries. Need to make the rational clear. Distinguish the type of fisheries. The north area of high priority will be a big constraint for purse seine fisheries.	J.S. to respond by clarifying.
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	Would like to know if there is a layer of territorial waters of 12nm from HWM as definition of EEZ is not including the territorial sea and some regulations may not apply to migratory stocks.	
<i>1250 – 1350 hrs Lunch</i>		
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	Please explain what Zone 1 consists of.	J.S. responded existing categories under PA and SFA legislation.
Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design 2.0	Uncomfortable to discuss these areas as not enough information so comments made will be very general.	J.S. to respond.
Meeting Adjourned at 1605 hrs.		

1350 hrs- Break out groups

1. Commercial fishing, SFA
2. Tourism, fly fishing and sport fishing
3. Biodiversity & conservation

Each group – One recorder, one presenter of summary.

Minutes submitted by: Helena Sims on 16 November 2016

Annex I: Meeting Agenda

MSP Stakeholder Engagement

Meeting 5

Tuesday 9 June 2015

8:30 AM – 4:00 PM

Location: ICCS Room 2

ICCS - International Conference Centre of Seychelles

Draft Agenda

Meeting Objectives:

1. To provide an update on the Seychelles Marine Spatial Planning (MSP) Initiative.
2. To receive input on the preliminary zoning design for Seychelles EEZ and discuss activities tables and “no take” areas.

Agenda Item #	Time	Agenda Topic
1	8:30 AM	Welcome and Opening <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Welcome from Ministry of Environment, Energy and Climate Change • Agenda review
2	9:00 AM	Seychelles Marine Spatial Planning (MSP) Initiative Update <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Brief Update on Seychelles Debt Swap and MSP process • Stakeholder Introductions and Roundtable for sector updates
	10:00 AM	Tea Break
3	10:15 AM	Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design version 2.0 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Summary of revisions to version 1.1 • Review and Discuss Proposed Zones and Marine Protections in version 2.0 • Review and Discuss Activities Tables for Proposed Zones
	12:15 PM	Lunch
	1:15 PM	Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design version 2.0, cont’d
	2:30 PM	Tea Break
	2:45 PM	Seychelles Preliminary Zoning Design version 2.0, cont’d
4	3:45 PM	Wrap Up and Next Steps
	4:00 PM	Adjourn