
MSP Steering Committee Meeting

Meeting #16

Date: Tuesday 30 July 2019

Time: 9:00 AM to 12:00 PM

Location: STC conference room, Victoria, Mahe

Minutes

Meeting Objectives:

1. To review and discuss data, information and stakeholder input for zoning design options Milestone 3
2. To develop recommendations for Executive Committee for Zone 1 and Zone 2 areas
3. To discuss implementation of Zone 2 – Medium Biodiversity and Sustainable Uses

Attendance:

Mr. Alain de Comarmond – Co-Chair PS Environment, MEECC
Mr. Andy Rylance – GoS-UNDP-GEF PA Finance Project
Ms. Angelique Pouponneau- SEYCCAT CEO
Ms. Bernice Senaratne- Dept. of Tourism
Mr. Daig Romain- PCU GoS-UNDP-GEF PA Finance Project
Ms. Elke Talma- PCU
Ms. Evita Delpech- Intern of SeyCCAT
Ms. Francesca Adrienne- Blue Economy Department
Dr. Jeanne Mortimer – ICS
Ms. Michelle Murray- ICS CEO
Mr. Patrick Samson- PetroSeychelles
Mr. Pierre-Andre Adam - ICS
Mr. Peter Purvis- Industrial Tuna Fisheries (Purse Seine) Representative
Mr. Selby Remy, SNPA
Mr. Sindu Parekh- The Hire Craft Association of Seychelles
Ms. Vania Robert- SeyCCAT Admin Executive
Ms. Veronica Uzice- representative SFA

MSP Core Team:

Dr. Joanna Smith, MSP Science & Process Lead, TNC Canada
Ms. Helena Sims, MSP Project Manager, TNC Africa

Absent:

Mr. Amit Wasseberg- SHTA
Mr. Wills Agricole, PS Energy & Climate change, MSP SC Co-Chair
Mr. Vincent Lucas – Seychelles Fishing Authority
Mr. Aubrey Lesperance - Seychelles Fishing Authority (Mariculture)
Dr. Frauke Fleischer-Dogley – SIF
Mr. Keith Andre, FBOA
Dr. Jan Robinson – SWIOFISH3

Mr. Glenny Savy, IDC
 Mr. Peter Brinn- GCCA+ Project
 Mr. Denis Matatiken, Special Advisor to Minister, MEECC
 Mr. Brian Charlette- MFTEP
 Ms. Jennifer Jasmine- MFTEP
 Mr. Lindsay Chong-Seng- PCA
 Ms. Ashley Dias- MEECC
 Miss Elissa Socrate rep SFA
 Ms. Cynthia Adrienne- MHILT
 Mrs. Joanna Prosper – GoS-UNDP-GEF Outer Island Project Manager
 Mr. Justin Prosper – MSP Data Custodian, MEECC
 Ms. Kelly Hoareau- UniSey
 Mrs. Marie-May Muzungaile– DG Biodiversity Conservation and Management, MEECC
 Dr. David Rowat –MCSS

Minutes;

Agenda Item #	Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
1.1	Welcome	The MSP core team welcomed all the participants to the meeting.	
1.2	Agenda Review	The agenda of the meeting was reviewed and adopted without any changes.	Annex I
		The participant packet was reviewed.	Annex II
1.3	Review Minutes and Action Items from SC #15	The minutes of SC meeting #15 was reviewed and approved. Some follow up queries are summarised;	
	Pg. 2- GEF 7	The MSP SC was informed that the sites for the GEF7 project formulation proposed include; Ste Anne, Aride, Cosmoledo & Astove. The Project Identification Form (PIF) is currently being developed.	
		The MSP SC was informed by the representative from tourism that a survey was conducted with the yacht charter operators and that 60% of the yachts go to the Amirantes (approximately 150 boats). Note yacht charter is different from boat charter. Yacht charters are live aboard. Boat charters are day boats although they generally would have the same activities.	
2.0	MSP Zoning Design Options Milestone 3 – Discuss the data and information by area:	The areas of high agreement was presented to the SC. These included; Inner Islands – spawning sites? Denis Island – Zone 2. Amirantes deep water – Zone 2 Etoile, Boudeuse, Desnoeuvs – Zone 1 Platte and Coetivy – Zone 2 Alphonse – Zone 2 Farquhar Group – Zone 2 Cosmoledo and Astove – Zone 2 Assumption – Zone 2 St Joseph- zone 2	

Agenda Item #	Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
		The areas to resolve were discussed per area.	
2.10	Area 7a: African Banks	The proposal for African Banks 7a was presented to the SC. The proposal includes the existing Protected Areas boundary on the East and out West as proposed in the TWG 11. The area is proposed as a Z1 and is 20.8 sq. Km (0.002% of the EEZ). The area captures a platform reef sand cay feature, which is only found in 6 places in the Seychelles EEZ.	See further discussions on African Banks in Area 7p summary.
		A request was made for the distance from West to East of the area being proposed as Z1.	Up to 5km.
		Marine Charters agreement as a Z1.	
2.11	Area 7c: D'Arros and St Joseph	A proposal of D'Arros as a Z1 was presented to the SC. The area proposed is 31.4 sq. km (0.002% of EEZ). The area picks up a platform reef atoll like rim feature. It additionally picks up platform reef atoll lagoon, which is also only found on Platte. D'Arros is the only area in the Amirantes being picked up as a wetland area. St Joseph is being proposed as a Z2.	
		The SC was reminded that in the past, there was an initiation to propose D'Arros and St Joseph as a Ramsar site (internationally recognised wetland area).	
		Clarification was sought on the distance of the boundary from the High Water Mark North to the boundary of D'Arros. It was proposed that 1km to the North is considered as the maximum for the boundary as there is a 60m drop to the North West, which is important to the Charter industry.	Adjust D'Arros boundary accordingly. JS.
2.12	Area 7k: D'Arros to Poivre	The area from D'Arros to Poivre was presented to the SC and was proposed as a Z1. The area has 40% of seagrass and captures 50% of the high relief bank patch reef complex feature. The area is 370 sq. Km - 0.03% of the EEZ.	
		Concerns were raised pertaining to the sea cucumber fishery in this area and it was proposed to compromise this area as a trade off for African Banks.	Review sea cucumber fishery data for area. JS., HS., RT.
2.13	Amirantes South 7p	Amirantes South proposed, as Z1 is 1,313 sq. km – 0.1% EEZ. 7g – Desnoeuvs - 43% of platform reef, rocky rim (5 places) – 1st ranking in EEZ; seagrasses cover 65% 7h - Marie-Louise- 36% of platform reef, rocky rim (5 places) – 2nd ranking in EEZ; seagrasses cover 75% Boudeuse- 16 % of platform reef, rocky rim (5 places) – 3rd ranking in EEZ; seagrasses cover 34% 7l - Etoile – Boudeuse- 8% of bank barrier complex (13 places) – 1st rank in EEZ; seagrasses cover 62% 7c – Etoile- 5% of platform reef, sand cay (6 places) – 5th rank in EEZ; seagrasses cover 80%	Summary of ecological features from ppt.

Agenda Item #	Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
		<p>-Green sea turtle and Hawksbill turtle foraging and nesting beaches -10 species of seabirds and 10 species of cetaceans -No months over the 1 deg C thermal stress threshold in 17 years</p>	
		<p>It was proposed to make African Banks a Z2 (for sea cucumber) and recover the area and features lost as Z1 in D'Arros to Poivre 7k and Amirantes South 7p as they are in better condition.</p>	
		<p>It was pointed out that the African Banks Z1 proposed is not a high value area for sea cucumber. They are more in African Banks to Remire area 7j.</p>	
		<p>It was pointed out that it is important to provide multiple areas for fishing for a balance for sustainable fishing as if all the fishing effort is directed to only one or a few areas there will be more fishing pressure on those areas, which will lead to their degradation. It was also highlighted that there is a need for sheltered areas to fish in bad weather.</p>	
		<p>It was pointed out that Marie Louise and the drop off are important for fisheries and marine charters and that there is high sea cucumber fisheries effort in the middle of the area proposed. A suggestion was made for the boundary of 7p to be adjusted and to keep simple straight line and shapes. It was proposed to have a straight line from Marie Louise to Etoile and to exclude the drop off and Marie-Louise in the Z1.</p>	
		<p>A concern was raised that there is a lack of spatial data on the sea cucumber fisheries but that major decisions are being made on anecdotal information on the sea cucumber fishery areas. A concern was also that there is information indicating a crash of the sea cucumber stocks and the need to decide on how prioritisation for these areas are made. It was also re-iterated that Marie-Louise is a very high biodiversity area and would be ideal as a zone 1.</p>	
		<p>The SC was reminded that there was support to make African Banks a Z2 as a compromise for proposing 7p as a Z1 in Amirantes South. If 7p is a sea cucumber area the compromise would be to keep this area as a Z1 and make the North Amirantes African Banks 7j, 7a zone 2.</p>	<p>MSP core team need justification of sea cucumber areas in the Amirantes. JS., HS. Confirmed by SFA that sea cucumber fishing occurs in the South Amirantes. The data to be provided by SFA to define these areas. VU. JS.</p>
		<p>Marine Charters expressed support to have Z1 in the South but that there is a need to include some point</p>	

Agenda Item #	Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
		to fish there especially for protection and operation during bad weather.	
		It was proposed to adjust the shape of the area 7p with use of best available data to propose a Z1.	
	Summary of discussions- African Banks 7a	African Banks 7a – Zone 2- sustainable fishing and management plan as a compromise for a zone 1 in Amirantes South.	
2.14	D'Arros 7q	The SC was informed by the MSP core team that there was high agreement for D'Arros 7q to be proposed as a zone 1 – considering the 1km boundary North from the HWM and extending West to adjust the size & pending political objections of protection of D'Arros 2 years ago (uncertain). The MSP core team is awaiting a copy of the report of National Assembly on the objections of D'Arros in the previous years.	
		The SC was advised that the confusion at that time was that St Joseph was included to be protected. There was also concern about the process to gazette the areas, which was carried out without public input. There were concerned on the private ownership and on the control of access.	
		A comment was made that shark feeding should not be allowable in Zone 1	Section 6 of fisheries act, 32 (3) prohibits shark feeding.
2.15	D'Arros to Poivre 7k	The MSP core team informed the SC that there is high agreement for a Z1 for the area from D'Arros to Poivre, but keep in mind that; -Core team to check with SFA for sea cucumber effort and that -Marine charters are ok with this area if changes are made to Amirantes South 7p.	
		There was a query on the distance from the sand cay to Poivre?	Approximately 7km. JS.
		The SC was informed that there is a proposal for aquaculture around Poivre and Desroches with Poivre as Sea cucumber ranching. The SFA representative advised that the outer island sites are confirmed and decided.	SFA to send coordinates of aquaculture sites in outer islands.
		Other SC members were of the opinion that the aquaculture sites were proposed areas but that there is no firm agreement and confirmation on the sites from Government.	To check OIP management plan for aquaculture. JS. HS.
2.16	Amirantes South 7p	The MSP proposed the compromised area for Amirantes South presented to approximately 1000 sq. km. The compromise excludes Marie Louise and the drop-off as a Z1 with the drop off seaward a Z2.	

Agenda Item #	Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
		The SC was advised that the counter proposal would include Marie Louise as a zone 1.	
		Representatives from Marine Charters advised that if Marie Louise is proposed as a zone 1 it would depend on the distance from the HWM as the drop off is 500m East of Marie Louise.	
		The SC was advised that the Napoleon is targeted on casting around Marie-Louise on catch and release from 5m to the drop off (500m) and this is the only location other than Providence for this species.	
		A proposal was made to separate the island from either East West or North South.	Charters confirmed an interest in NE, SE and E of Marie-Louise.
		An alternative proposal for Amirantes South was made to use the same configuration as Assumption by splitting the Marie Louise island from West and East with the West – Z1 and East Z2.	MSP core team to re-configure the design of the area and revert with options. JS., HS.
2.17	Bird Island 2a	The MSP SC was informed that a proposal to move the top/North boundary of the Z1 of Bird island 2a down to the South and to extend the boundary West to include a shallow feature to make the area to the same size. However, this would mean all drop off areas would be in a Z2	
		There was some support for the proposed 2nm boundary.	
		There was no agreement from representatives of Marine Charters to include the drop off as Z1.	
		Representatives from PetroSeychelles advised that they do not operate to 5km of the island hence have no preference	
2.20	Mascarene (5) V5.1	The core team requested feedback on support for Mascarene V5.1.	
		SC members expressed support in terms of redundancy and spread of Z1 across the EEZ.	
		The representatives from the BE department prefer the Aldabra extension option 3.	
		The SC was advised by the MEECC that the MSP formulation of the JMA has not begun and that the Seychelles MSP Mascarene area should hence be considered independently of the JMA.	
		SC members advised the need to be forward thinking in preparation for discussions in the JMA.	
2.21	Aldabra to Farquhar (13)	There was a proposal to extend the Aldabra Z1 east towards Farquhar to capture features that are also in the Mascarene and Coco de Mer as an alternative to the latter 2 areas (V5.1 & 5.2). This proposal however is pending input from Industrial Fisheries Group.	

Agenda Item #	Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
		There was a request for comparison of biodiversity representation of the Aldabra extension proposal vs. V5.1 and V5.2	The Aldabra extension proposal captures more canyons and seamounts and more features are captured compared to V5.1 and V5.2.
		Petroseychelles expressed that they prefer the Aldabra extension design but would need the coordinates as the South area of the EEZ is being researched to analyse the ridge connecting Madagascar to Farquhar. Hence there would be a need for a discussion on allowable activities and linkage on proposed law pending RE seismic surveys for research vs. exploration.	Final coordinates of proposed area to be shared with PetroSeychelles. JS., HS.
		SC members expressed that from a cost perspective, less fragmentation is cheaper and hence the Aldabra extension proposal would be best in terms of economies of scale.	
		The members from marine charters supported the extension as the compromise for Amirantes South but provided that McLeod, Bulldog and Wizard reef are not included in Z1.	JS., HS., RT.
		The SC members were reminded that the Mascarene area was initially proposed as a bird feeding areas.	To check advice log. JS.
2.22	Assomption Area Z1 and Z2	A proposal was made to the SC to divide Assomption in 2 zones with a Zone 2 around the lagoon areas to allow for any potential development of the island.	
		SC members advised that there is high sea turtle nesting on the beaches and a potential for more nesting that Aldabra particularly on the West side of the island with a projection to increase. There would be a need to control lights for developments	
		Concerns were raised as this area is already gazetted in milestone 1 as a zone 1 and that this bring into question the other gazetted areas and the MSP decision making process. Some members expressed strong opinions against this proposal for these reasons.	The MSP zoning is still in discussion and areas can be changed with new information. JS.
		SC members questioned that if the Zone 1 area is removed where would a new Z1 area be allocated.	
		Members raised the concerns of the sensitivities for these discussions pertaining to the military development discussions on Assomption.	Military would supersede a biodiversity zone. JS.
		Some members expressed agreement to have part of Assomption as a zone 2 as a strategy for future development of the island.	
		The MEECC pointed out that ideally a decision that has been made previously should not be revisited as it would open up a discussion on other areas and sets	

Agenda Item #	Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
		<p>a dangerous precedent. In terms of tourism development, as per the outer islands development plan includes some infrastructure can be provided for visitors that require shelter (not hotels and marine based activities). MEECC was also concerned that the main beach being proposed as Z2 area is a high turtle nesting beach.</p>	
		<p>Members from the tourism sector expressed that it would be good to have a tourism base on Assomption in the Aldabra island group and that this would have to be a zone 2 to allow other tourism attractions to that island so that it is financially viable.</p>	
		<p>A concern was raised that the discussions on Assomption were not separate and process was not followed.</p>	<p>In terms of process and legislation, the area and file was also on public review twice, milestone 1 and milestone 2 as per the NPNCA. HS.</p>
3.0	<p>Legislation to support implementation of Zone 2 areas – MSP core team and MEECC Sustainable use category in the new proposed Act for protected areas</p>	<p>Discussions on Zone 2 and legislation for zone 2.</p> <p>MSP SC members expressed concern that several representatives on the MSP SC have not reviewed/seen the revised protected areas act. The Zone 2 areas are currently an AONB and equivalent to sustainable use category in the revision. The concern is that the Z2 areas are being and will be portrayed as a biodiversity area and not a sustainable use zone. There are concerns with the definition of the legislation particularly the sustainable use category. A request was made that MSP SC members have a more detailed information on the law. A round table discussion followed to determine the views of the MSP SC members on the matter.</p> <p>ITF- In agreement to the legal drafting of the law and compatibility of the MSP process.</p> <p>Tourism – find the act broad and vague in terms of the definition of the sustainable use category.</p> <p>MEECC- Expressed that there has been a process to the drafting of the Act and it has been on stakeholder review. Further details will be elaborated in the regulations.</p> <p>Members expressed that the public review of the act should have gone to the MSP steering committee and that the MSP SC did not have a specific invitation to review the Act.</p> <p>A proposal was made for the MSP SC to have their own independent legal advice.</p>	<p>Clarity and specifics is being requested from the Steering committee. AD.</p> <p>.</p>

Agenda Item #	Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
		Members were advised that the MSP is seeking legal advice on some loopholes, as is the MEECC with the Attorney general's office.	Concerns can be brought to the EC to be flagged.JS., HS.
		Members of the MSP SC requested a copy of the final draft of the Bill that was circulated to the Attorney General's office.	MSP to circulate to the MSP SC. HS.
4	Next steps	The MSP core team would meet the EC to propose the revisions and comments from the round of consultations. Following this, the zoning design will be revised and brought back to the committees is September/October 2019 for review.	
Meeting adjourned at 1230hrs on 30 July 2019.			

Minutes submitted by: Helena Sims on 20 September 2019

Annex I: Meeting Agenda

SEYCHELLES MARINE SPATIAL PLAN (MSP) INITIATIVE

MSP Steering Committee

Meeting #16

Date: Tuesday 30 July 2019

Time: 9:00 AM - Noon

Location: STC Conference Centre, Victoria, Mahe

Agenda

Meeting Objectives:

4. To review and discuss data, information and stakeholder input for zoning design options Milestone 3
5. To develop recommendations for Executive Committee for Zone 1 and Zone 2 areas
6. To discuss implementation of Zone 2 – Medium Biodiversity and Sustainable Uses

#	Time	Topic
1	9:00	Opening – Steering Committee co-Chair MEECC <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Welcome and Agenda review • Review Minutes and Action Items from SC #15
2	9:20	MSP Zoning Design Options Milestone 3 – Dr. Joanna Smith and Ms. Helena Sims <ol style="list-style-type: none"> i. Discuss the data and information by area: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • DEEP WATER (> 200 m) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Area 5: Mascarene (options 5.1 and 5.2) ○ Area 16: Coco de Mer

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Area 13: Aldabra Group “extension” (TWG11) ● SHALLOW WATER (0-200 m) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Area 2: Bird Island ○ Area 7a: African Banks (TWG11) ○ Area 7c: D’Arros and St Joseph (TWG11) ○ Area 7k: D’Arros to Poivre ○ Area 7n: Etoile-Boudeuse-Desnouefs (EC16) ○ Area 7o: Etoile-Boudeuse-Desnoeuifs-Marie-Louise (TWG11) ii. Allowable Activities Tables and Area-based Management Considerations, as needed iii. Recommendations to MSP Executive Committee for Zone 1 and Zone 2 areas
	10:15	Coffee Break
2	10:30	MSP Zoning Design Options Milestone 3, cont’d
3	11:40	Legislation to support implementation of Zone 2 areas – MSP core team and MEECC <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Sustainable use category in the new proposed Act for protected areas
4	11:55	Any Other Business (AOB)
5	12:00	Next MSP meetings in Sep/Oct, and next steps. Adjourn

Annex II: List of documents provided for the MSP SC15 meeting.

SEYMSP_SC15_Minutes_18july2019
SEYMSP_SC16_Agenda_30Jul2019_draft
SEYMSP_ZoneStats_Map_51_52_20190726
Zoning_Design_V52_Amirantes_Group_Bathymetry_16July2019
Zoning_Design_V52_Amirantes_Group_ShallowGeomor_16July2019
7o_African_Banks_Geomorphology_26July2019
7p_Amirantes_South_Geomorphology_26July2019
7q_DArros_Geomorphology_26July2019
13_Aldabra_East_Option4_largest_22July2019
13c_Assumption_Geomorphology_26July2019
SEYMSP_ActivitiesTable_Milestone3_Map5.2_Codes_20190716
SEYMSP_ActivitiesTable_Milestone3_Map5.2_Zone1_20190716
SEYMSP_ActivitiesTable_Milestone3_Map5.2_Zone2_20190716