
MSP Steering Committee

Meeting #8

Monday 24 October & Tuesday 25 October 2016

0900-1200 hrs.

Location: ICCS Room 3

Minutes

Meeting Objectives:

1. To review the updated Terms of Reference and confirm Steering Committee (SC) members
2. To receive an update on the MSP Process and provide input to MSP outputs

Attendance:

Alain de Comarmond, PS Environment- MSP SC Co-Chair

Cynthia Aglae, MLUH- MSP Member, representing coastal development

Justin Prosper, MEECC- MSP Data Manager

Glenny Savy, IDC- MSP Member, representing tourism

Ronny Renaud, IDC- Alternate MSP member, representing tourism

David Rowat, MCSS- SC Member & Chairperson Marine Ecology TWG

Pierre-Andre Adam, ICS- MSP Member & Vice-Chair Marine Ecology TWG

Jeanne Mortimer, ICS- MSP Member & Vice Chair Terrestrial Ecology TWG

Virginie Lagarde, FBOA- MSP alternate member representing Fisheries Sector & Co-Chair Socio-economic TWG.

Patrick Samson, PetroSeychelles- MSP Member Representing Petroleum Sector & Co-Chair Socio-economic TWG:

Andrew Grieser-Johns, PCU Programme Coordinator/Chief Technical Adviser- MSP SC Observer

Joanna Prosper, PCU GoS-UNDP GEF Outer Island Project Manager- MSP SC Observer

Jan Robinson, SFA- MSP SC Observer

Denis Matatiken, Special Advisor to Minister MEECC- Invited as potential new SC member

Andy Rylance, PCU GoS-UNDP-GEF PA Finance Project- Invited as potential new SC member

Dominique Benzaken, MFTBE- Invited as potential new SC alternate member (Blue Economy)

Sabrina Renaud, MEECC- Admin Support

Joanna Smith, TNC- MSP Project Science & Process Lead

Helena Sims, TNC- MSP Project Manager

Absent:

Wills Agricole, PS Energy & Climate change MSP SC Co-Chair

Amanda Padayachy, Ministry of Finance, Trade and Blue Economy- MSP SC Member

Jude Bijoux, MAF & SFA- MSP SC member representing Fisheries & Marine ecology Sector & Co-Chair Socio-economic TWG

Bernice Elizabeth, Dept. of Tourism- MSP SC member representing tourism sector

Flavien Joubert, SNPA- Member representing tourism and marine ecology sector

Frauke Dogley , SIF- MSP SC member & Chairperson Terrestrial Ecology TWG
 Paul Hodoul , Tourism- MSP SC member & Co-Chair Socio-economic TWG: Member representing tourism sector
 Keith Andre, FBOA- MSP SC Member representing Fisheries Sector & Co-Chair Socio-economic TWG
 Elisa Socrate, SFA- MSP SC Member representing Fisheries Sector

Minutes

Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
Agenda	Agenda was reviewed and adopted.	
SC meeting minutes	Minutes of SC meeting #6 was reviewed; adopted without changes.	
SC members	Who is representing SFA? Dr Jude Bijoux's sabbatical leave ends in a few months; check with SFA if to keep on MSP SC.	H.S. follow up with SFA
	Add Ms. Mary-May Jeremie to MSP SC who will replace Mr. Flavien Joubert	H.S.
MSP SC ToR	Question about observers vs. members.	A.D. Observers are important to allow for synergies with ongoing national initiatives that require input at one specific point in time. The observers provide input for information sharing to allow for coordination and integration. H.S. to add to ToR. Update the ToR to reflect the roles and responsibilities of members vs. observers; guidance needs to be sought from Executive committee.
	Are observers allowed to intervene?	A.D. No, however provide input when required.
	When an observer's project is funding an integral part of the MSP process they should be allowed to intervene and provide input into the decision making process.	J.S. There is a need to re-look at which entities are stakeholders and ensure there is no conflict of interest. A stakeholder is normally a person affected by the process vs. a decision making entity.
Updates on SEYCCAT & Debt Swap	Request for an update to the MSP SC on Blue Bonds and roles with SEYCCAT	This will be brought to the MSP SC once finalised and official. H.S.
	Dr. Smith provided updates on the formalisation of an MSP Executive Committee with an overview of mandates and responsibilities.	
Timeline for completing phase I	Ms. Sims provided an update on the need to draft an MSP Policy. The MSP Policy of South Africa may be a good reference as is broad.	H.S. to distribute SA Policy.
	Question on how will the socio-economic analysis for the MSP be carried out	J.S. A ToR has been drafted. The study will be spatial and will look at the broad impacts & benefits of the

Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
		MSP on key sectors, primarily tourism and fisheries for Seychelles. J.S./H.S. to send ToR to MSP SC for review.
	Concern regarding the timeline (short) and the expected outputs for the MSP.	J.S. The outputs are conditional in the debt swap loan agreement though there is a grace period that may be used.
	Where does Seychelles stand with the EU fisheries agreement?	J.R. The agreement is set to be reviewed in 2019 and finalised in 2020. J.S. According to Minister Adam, the EU fisheries agreement will not be impacted by the zoning design up to 2020. However, the zoning design is to be developed and not constrained by the fisheries agreement per se, as in the development of the Zone 1 and 2 areas. We are expecting input from the EU to discuss zones that affect the Industrial Fisheries agreement & for the planning of these zones.
	Mariculture Master Plan is in public review right now. 235 page EIA document and 700 page master plan. Will get link.	J.R. (SFA).
	Recommendation that members of the MSP working group are added as members of the MSP SC. Mr. Beatty Hoarau is the chair of the MSP WG. It would be advantageous to have 2 members recommended so that there is representation at all times.	H.S. to write to MSP WG to receive the 2 nominations.
	Recommendation that FBOA is added as a member of SEYCCAT as a Civil Society Organisation (CSO) member.	H.S. FBOA is approved to attend SEYCCAT meetings as an observer (Mr. B. Hoarau), this recommendation can be brought to the SEYCCAT Board.
Marine Spatial Plan Document Outline	If the plan is a regulatory document, there needs to be a legal context added.	J.S. Legal context to be added after 1.2.
MSP Atlas	Dr. Smith requested feedback from the SC on who would like a printed copy of the Atlas, where else should hard copies be distributed, and how many? Recommendation to have a digital format online. Suggestion for one copy to MEECC centre on Mahe, Praslin and La Digue for use in open houses. Hard copy for semi-industrial and artisanal fisheries hardcopy. District Administrator's office for public consultation (Praslin, La Digue) and National Library and MEECC Doc Centre (Mahe). Waterproof paper would be good for some copies. Members can opt out for a printed copy.	Digital format will be published on the SEYMSP website. Recipients; MSP Core Team, MSP SC Members, MSP Executive Committee members, MSP TWG Members. H.S. to determine how many final copies required.

Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
MSP Tools	Dr. Smith updated SC that the MSP website has been updated and has a new domain name (www.seymsp.com) and that the previous domain name still works.	
Marine InVEST model	Dr. Smith presented on a small study in collaboration with the Natural Capital Project to value ecosystem services of tourism in Seychelles.	J.S. To distribute paper on methodology to MSP SC.
	How were the photographs georeferenced?	J.S. This is done by the user.
	How does the model tell us information that we do not already know?	J.S. The model tells us photo user days, which is an indication of relative importance.
	Recommendation that MSP Core Team liaises with Ministry of Tourism as they have an e-marketing unit with data (A research section has recently been created which looks at markets & indices). Key person for digital data being Mr. Vahid Jacob.	J.S. Ministry of Tourism assisted and reports were provided with tables. No spatial data received. Follow up needed with Mr. Jacob.
DAY 1 meeting adjourned at 1155hrs.		
Day 2		
Review of Zoning Design v2.2	Dr. Smith asked SC as to what popping is, and why is it banned around IDC islands. Dr. Smith asked about scientific data in Seychelles for catch-and-release sport and fly fishing.	DR- High stress to big game fish (targets using poppers) so when catch and release is used less likely to survive.
	Dr. Smith asked about scientific data in Seychelles for catch-and-release sport and fly fishing, and advice for Allowable Activities Table. Response given that the impact of fly-fishing depends on areas; some research shows that a cycle of closures to allow replenishment and recovery of areas can work. Operations can be sustainable if done properly. Saltwater fishing in deep water is different and needs different attention. Could be something that the MSP working group addressed as well as the impacts of catch and release?	J.S. Need published studies or more research on known impacts of fly fishing and survival rates after catch and release. H.S. Follow up with MSP Working Group at next meeting
	Dr. Smith asked about any data for marine mammals sightings in Seychelles. Yes, there is a bit more information.	D.R to provide Shapefile.
	Dr. Smith asked about locations for sea cucumber fisheries Could be addressed through the MSP WG as there are fishermen from that sector on the WG.	H.S. follow up with MSP WG
Marxan with Wrap up and Other Business Zones	Clarification requested to see the document that the presentation was referring to, and whether it is possible to get a copy of the document.	J.S. Paper being prepared but not published (yet). Can provide the document to explain the methodology.
	Query as to why Aldabra not being identified as high irreplaceability?	J.S. The model is looking for diversity and gradients and capturing irreplaceability.. So it's possible that there are higher irreplaceability

Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
		scores around Cosmoledo and Astove because greater diversity of habitat types. This is why validation is required. Condition is also not included in this model.
	It was noted it would be good to update the VMS data for semi-industrial longline. Semi-industrial fishing has increased by 3X in last 1.5 years. There were 10 boats and three active last year. Now there are 25 active semi-industrial longline vessels. Before, there was data for only 2 to 3 boats.	H.S. & J.S. follow up with SFA (Roddy and Freddy)
	It was noted that need to list all of the uses in the stakeholder preferences layer. Need a legend on the map.	J.S., R.T.
	PetroSeychelles asked for the petroleum map to include the seismic data on the stakeholder preferences map. Do not include areas of interest though any of these areas could become active.	J.S. R.P.S. to share updated seismic layer with MSP core team.
	Suggestion that MSP maps put source information on the maps in powerpoint and atlas. Discussion about source vs. authors for the analysis. Source: MEECC database.	J.S. & R.T.
	Break out groups to discuss Marxan with Zones scenario results and validate results. See below for group notes.	
Wrap up and Other Business	Question on the Invest Model. Flickr targets US and Canada. Most Seychelles tourism is European and thus the Flickr database may not reflect the tourism industry of Seychelles.	J.S: Spencer Wood (Natural Capital Project) tried other platforms (instagram) and there was high % similarity between results.
Day 2 Adjourned at 1200hrs.		

Break out groups for feedback on Marxan with Zones scenarios

Q1: What does and does not make sense to you in terms of the locations for the high or low irreplaceability values?

- Such as, where are the high or low irreplaceability values unusual or unlikely?
- What data or information are you using to 'validate' this?

Q2: What irreplaceability areas do and don't seem to be working with zoning design 2.2? For the ones not working, are there other areas you would propose for zones 1 & 2?

Group 1 Feedback

1. Sub-region map and bias for selection – Request to feature 2 or 3 sub-regions instead of 5. (Reduce redundancy and replication)? Combinations suggested: Aldabra + Farquhar; Amirantes + Coetivy; Mahe plateau OR Aldabra/Farquhar + Amirantes/Mahe Plateau + Coetivy
2. Biodiversity Scenario: Why Aldabra not selected? And Farquhar seems backwards – highest irreplaceability value in South but this is Zone 2, lowest irreplaceability value in North and this is Zone 1 (doesn't match the current zoning design 2.2). There is a request for updated VMS data to support the zoning design 2.2.
3. Farquhar is a potential area for petroleum exploration. Is this featured in economic map? Licensed blocks are included. Seismic base map + licensed blocks should be used. Change stakeholder preferences layer to include seismic base map (Patrick can make sure we have the most up-to-date map). Seismic base maps would be a better proxy for prospects as they reflect specific areas than large license blocks.
4. West of Alphonse is consistent on all the maps, and is not currently a zone in zoning design 2.2. Could be a new zone but need to cross check with VMS data.
5. Drop off and sport fishing zones north drop-off Zone 1 on zoning design 2.2 but not on irreplaceability – the west and east Zone 1 areas.
6. NW and N of EEZ are picked up by all the maps but not in the zoning design and could be used for Zone 1 or Zone 2. Could this substitute for other zones that create conflict and to meet deep water representation goals.

Group 2 Feedback

1. Mahe plateau – still shown as Zone 3 (and wondering why it isn't Zone 2 or interim Zone 2). The Mahe Plateau Demersal Fishery Management plan is being finalised (target by December 2016); The Mahe Plateau represents 4% of EEZ and is also consistently being picked up in the irreplaceability.
2. Aldabra not selected.
3. Area #13 SE – Mascarene (top of Mascarene Ridge) not showing up in irreplaceability (weak in Economic Bias) and so not consistent with zoning design 2.2. There is very low irreplaceability value.
4. East of Amirantes not in zoning design but showing up in irreplaceability and could be a potential new zone.
5. Coetivy and Alphonse are Zone 1 in zoning design and also picked up as irreplaceability BUT update for VMS data for longline in those areas may reveal high use and socio-economic importance.
6. The main Amirantes trench is not being picked up by irreplaceability – (but it is shown to meet the 30% goal). What is the value of the trench?
7. Deep water North areas not picked up in zoning design (same comment as group 1). However these are high use areas for semi-industrial; industrial purse seine fisheries, even if not in the stakeholder preferences layer.
8. Same concern about sub-regions forcing the Marxan as group 1
9. Generally matches original GOS-UNDP-GEF Marxan model, which is good, plus the seamounts.
10. Data validation for the scenarios being done using previous models and institutional memory.

Minutes submitted by: Helena Sims on 16 November 2016

Annex I: Meeting Agenda

MSP Steering Committee

Meeting #8

Monday 24 October & Tuesday 25 October 2016

0900-1200 hrs.

Location: ICCS Room 3

Version 2

Meeting Objectives:

1. To review the updated Terms of Reference and confirm Steering Committee (SC) members
2. To receive an update on the MSP Process and provide input to MSP outputs

#	Time	Topic
Monday 24 October 2016		
1	9:00	Opening – Principal Secretary Alain De Comarmond (Co-Chair) and Ms. Helena Sims <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Agenda review • Confirm Steering Committee members • Approval of Minutes Steering Committee 5 and 6 • Review of action items Steering Committee 7 (March 2016) • Review updated SC Terms of Reference
2	9:45	MSP Process and Technical Outputs – Dr. Joanna Smith and Ms. Helena Sims <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Update on Debt swap and SeyCCAT • Integration with other marine projects in Seychelles • MSP Process Update: timeline for completing Phase 1 • Marine Spatial Plan document outline • MSP Atlas – discuss content and timeline for review • TOR for Socio-Economic impact analysis
	10:15	Tea break
3	10:30	Technical analyses to inform marine spatial plan –Dr. Joanna Smith <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ecosystem Services Marine InVEST model for tourism and recreation valuation • Introduction to Marxan with Zones: scenarios and outputs
4	11:55	Wrap-up, tomorrow’s agenda, and Adjourn
Tuesday 25 October 2016		
5	9:00	Zoning Design and Allowable Activities – Dr. Joanna Smith and Helena Sims <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scenarios and new possible areas for Zone 1 and Zone 2 • Allowable Activities Table
	10:15	Tea break
6	11:45	Wrap-up, action items, next meeting, and Adjourn

Annex II: Attendance List of Members Present on Days 1 and 2 of Steering committee meeting 8

Name	Organisation	Role on SC	24 Oct	25 Oct
Alain de Comarmond	PS Environment	MSP SC Co-Chair	Y	-
Cynthia Aglae	MLUH	Member, representing coastal development	Y	Y
Justin Prosper	MEECC	MSP Data Manager	Y	Y
Glenny Savy	IDC	Member, representing tourism	Y	-
Ronny Renaud	IDC	Alternate member, representing tourism	Y	Y
David Rowat	MCSS	Chairperson Marine Ecology TWG	Y	Y
Pierre-Andre Adam	ICS	Vice-Chair Marine Ecology TWG	Y	Y
Jeanne Mortimer	ICS	Vice Chair Terrestrial Ecology TWG	Y	Y
Virginie Lagarde	FBOA	Co-Chair Socio-economic TWG: Alternate member representing Fisheries Sector	Y	Y
Patrick Samson	PetroSeychelles	Co-Chair Socio-economic TWG: Representing Petroleum Sector	Y	Y
Andrew Grieser-Johns	PCU P.C./Chief Technical Adviser	Observer	Y	Y
Joanna Prosper	UNDP GEF Outer Island Project Manager	Observer	Y	Y
Jan Robinson	SFA	Observer	Y	-
Denis Matatiken	Special Advisor to Minister MEECC	Invited as potential new SC member (Ministry of Environment)	Y	Y
Andy Rylance	PCU (PA Finance Project)	Invited as potential new SC member (PA Finance)	-	Y
Dominique Benzaken	MFTBE	Invited as potential new SC alternate member (Blue Economy)	-	Y
Sabrina Renaud	MEECC	Admin Support	Y	Y
Joanna Smith	TNC	MSP Project Science & Process Lead	Y	Y
Helena Sims	TNC	MSP Project Manager	Y	Y
Wills Agricole	PS Energy & Climate change	MSP SC Co-Chair	-	-
Amanda Padayachy	Ministry of Finance, Trade and Blue Economy	Member	-	-
Jude Bijoux	MAF & SFA	Co-Chair Socio-economic TWG: Representing Fisheries & Marine Ecology	-	-
Bernice Elizabeth	Dept. of Tourism	Member representing tourism sector	-	-
Flavien Joubert	SNPA	Member representing tourism and marine ecology sector	-	-
Frauke Dogley	SIF	Chairperson - Terrestrial Ecology TWG	-	-
Paul Hodoul	Tourism	Co-Chair Socio-economic TWG: Member representing tourism sector	-	-
Keith Andre	FBOA	Co-Chair Socio-economic TWG: Member representing Fisheries Sector	-	-
Elisa Socrate	SFA	Member representing Fisheries Sector	-	-