
MSP Technical Working Group (TWG)

Meeting #10

Monday 25 March 2019

08:30 AM – 3:30 PM

Location: STC Conference Room, Victoria, Mahe

Minutes

Meeting Objectives:

- Discuss specific topics pertaining to priority areas for Milestone 3 as discussed in the inception workshop (21st March);
- Discuss and draft Allowable Activity Tables and management considerations for Milestone 3 areas;
- Review draft climate risk mapping/coral threat mapping for climate change adaptation

Member Attendance:

Aubrey Lucas- Sustainability for Seychelles- Terrestrial Ecology TWG
Bernice Senaratne- Tourism Department – Tourism TWG
Chris Mason-Parker – Global Vision International- Marine Ecology TWG
Daig Romain- GoS-UNDP-GEF PA Project- Finance & Implementation TWG
Daniella Payet- Allis – Seychelles Sustainable Tourism Foundation- Tourism TWG
David Rowat- Marine Conservation Society Seychelles- Marine Ecology TWG
Emmanuel Chassot- Consultant SFA – Fisheries TWG
Gilberte Gendron- Seychelles National Parks Authority- Marine Ecology TWG
Justin Prosper- GIS Unit, MEECC – MSP Data Manager
Isabelle Ravinia – Seychelles National Parks Authority – Marine Ecology TWG
Joanna Prosper- GoS-UNDP-GEF Outer Islands Project- Marine Ecology TWG
Lindsay Chong-Seng- Plant Conservation Action Group- Terrestrial Ecology TWG
Manuela Alcaniz- Scuba Divers Federation of Seychelles- Tourism TWG
Marquise David- Scuba Divers Federation of Seychelles- Tourism TWG
Patrick Samson- PetroSeychelles – Energy and Infrastructure TWG
Sabrena Lawrence- SWIOFISH3- Fisheries TWG
Terrence Athanase- Seychelles National Parks Authority - Terrestrial Ecology TWG
Wilna Accouche- Green Islands Foundation – Fisheries TWG
Vania Robert- Seychelles Conservation & Climate Adaptation Trust– Finance & Implementation TWG
Vincent Lucas- Seychelles Fishing Authority – Fisheries TWG

MSP Core Team

Helena Sims- MSP Project Manager, TNC Africa
Joanna Smith- MSP Science & Process lead, TNC Canada

Minutes;

Agenda Item #	Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
1.0	Opening	The MSP core team opened the technical working group meeting #10 and welcomed all participants to the meeting.	
1.1	Agenda Review	The agenda was reviewed and adopted without any changes	See Annex I for adopted agenda.
1.2	Review minutes from TWG9	A review of the minutes of the last meeting held on 3 October 2019 followed. Action items from the minutes were discussed as summarised in 1.3. The minutes were approved without any further changes.	
1.3	Action items discussed during minutes review.	2.1 – MCSS to share data as per minutes of TWG9 with MSP team.	MSP team to follow up. JS, HS.
1.4	Participant package components	A review of the composition of the participant package was carried out	See annex II of the participant package list of documents.
1.5	Roundtable updates from TWG members	There was a roundtable of introductions and updates were provided where available.	
		The TWG was informed that the costing analysis for the MSP has started and is being developed through partnership with the GoS-UNDP-GEF PA Finance Project and SeyCCAT.	
		TWG members were advised that the Outer Islands Project is developing business plans for the proposed PAs under the project.	
		Members were informed that a review of the Fisheries Act is underway mostly to domesticate some of the IOTC resolutions. In addition, committees for the implementation of the demersal fishery management plan have been formed.	
2.1	MSP Updates: Milestone 2, Governance Arrangements, Costing Analysis, and others	<p>Updates on the finalisation of the MSP milestone 2 were provided to the meeting participants;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The nomination files were submitted to GoS in 2018 and the files have been on public review with no comments received. -The coordinates of the areas are currently being registered and the official order will be signed by end of March 2019. -MSP governance framework was presented to cabinet in December 2018 and the paper is being 	

Agenda Item #	Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
		<p>reviewed by MFTIEP and DPA and will be presented for approval by Cabinet by Q2 2019.</p> <p>-MSP costing analysis for the 30% areas is being developed through the PCU PA Project, MSP and SeyCCAT.</p> <p>-SMART objectives for CC is being developed through advancing CC risk mapping for adaptation for economic activities and conservation.</p> <p>-A socio-economic impact analysis on Tuna fisheries was finalised and is currently under peer review before being made public. A presentation was provided in the inception workshop on 21 March 2019.</p>	
3.1	Milestone 3 Launch: Timeline and Outputs for Milestone 3	<p>The schedule of meetings for the March- April 2019 consultations was presented to the TWG for information;</p> <p>Tue 19 Mar- Executive Committee Meeting #14 Thu 21 Mar- MSP Workshop #22 for Inception Milestone 3: EC, SC, TWG members Mon 25 Mar- Technical Working Group Meeting #10 Fri 29 Mar- Public Workshop Mahe (Workshop #23) Sat 30 Mar - Public Workshop Praslin/La Digue (on Praslin) (Workshop #24) Tue 2 Apr - Steering Committee Meeting #15 (TBC) Thu 4 Apr- Executive Committee Meeting #15</p> <p>Bilaterals; TWG Fisheries, TWG Ecology: Climate Change, ICS, GIF and others.</p>	
		<p>The TWG was briefed on the next MSP milestones summarised as;</p> <p>EEZ is 1,349,093 km²</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Total Goal is 30% or 404,727 km² - Milestone 1 + 2 = 26% or 350,764 km² - Milestone 3 = 4% or <i>approx.</i> 54,000 km² <p>By Representation, by Area:</p>	

Agenda Item #	Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Within 12 nautical miles is 3.5% of EEZ → 30% is ~ 1.05% or <i>approx.</i> 14,000 km² - Deep water remaining is 3% or <i>approx.</i> 40,000 km² <p>By Zone:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Zone 1: 27,000 km² Zone 2: 27,000 km² - 7,000km² in shallow and 20, 000 km² in deep for each Z1 and Z2 <p>A reminder was provided to TWG that pre-2018, the total MPA area was 0.04% or 545 km²</p>	
	Maps of existing MPAs	Maps of existing PAs were presented to the TWG. The maps will need to be validated before they are printed.	
		It was pointed out that the terrestrial protected area map does not describe Curieuse as a Protected Area.	
		There were discussions on the gazetted shell reserves and their representation on the PA maps.	The shell reserves boundaries will be revised by the MSP team. The layers may also be separated by fishery areas or areas gazetted in the past. JS.
		There were some discussions on whether the shell reserves are included in the new fisheries act.	MSP core team to confirm with SFA.
		It was pointed out that studies have shown that the composition of bivalves and shell species is higher in these shell reserves.	
3.2	Milestone 3 Launch: Summary of Milestone 3 Launch Workshop (21 Mar 2019)	<p>A summary of the approach to developing milestone 3 was provided to TWG members.</p> <p>A summary of advice for milestone 3 was presented using a map of the zoning design with proposals for Z1 and Z2 areas.</p> <p>The milestone 3 building blocks (polygons of 1km boundary from the reef edge of each island) was presented to the TWG members.</p>	MSP core team to share core literature on TWG dropbox folders. JS. HS.

Agenda Item #	Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
		<p>A brief summary of the information and informing zoning categories was presented to TWG members.</p>	
		<p>Two zoning design options (v5.0) were presented to the TWG;</p> <p>Option 1 using replication and spacing of zone 1 across the archipelago. The revisions include;</p> <p>Remove Coco de Mer Remove Mascarene</p> <p>Inner Islands:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - East Zone 2 - West Zone 3 (* need more info) <p>North Drop off:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Bird Zone 1 - Denis Zone 2 - Deep water Zone 2 <p>Amirantes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Deep water Zone 1 - Atolls (1 km) Zone 2 <p>Platte Zone 1 Coetivy Zone 2 Alphonse:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - All Zone 2 <p>Farquhar:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Deep water Zone 1 - Atolls (1 km) Zone 2 <p>Cosmoledo and Astove:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Atolls (1 km) Zone 1 - Deep water Zone 2 <p>Option 2 avoiding most high use areas in shallow water for Z1 (low representation in shallow water) but representation and spacing across the corners of the EEZ. The design includes;</p> <p>Coco de Mer Zone 1 Mascarene Zone 1 Inner Islands</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - West Zone 3 (* need more info) <p>North Drop off:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - All Zone 2 <p>Amirantes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 6/10 atolls (1 km) Zone 1 - Deep water Zone 2 	

Agenda Item #	Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
		Platte Zone 2 Coetivy Zone 2 Alphonse: - All Zone 2 Farquhar: - Providence (1 km) Zone 1 - Deep water Zone 2 Cosmoledo and Astove: - All Zone 2	
		The issues to be resolved in milestone 3 that have been carried forward from discussions in previous years was presented to the TWG.	
3.3	TWG 10 discussion and input on zoning design	A summary of the discussions from the MSP inception workshop which was held on 21 March 2019 was presented to the TWG members. Area 1 is a high use area: category proposed Zone 2 or Zone 3 Bird: Zone 1 or 2 Denis: Zone 1 & 2 combination, or Zone 3 Mascarene – Zone 1, 2 or 3 Platte and Coetivy – Zone 2 Amirantes – area of focus for further discussion Alphonse - Zone 2 Farquhar - area of focus for further discussion Cosmoledo and Astove - Zone 2. Maybe lagoons Zone 1 Coco de Mer – Zone 1, 2 or 3 - Fly fishing and catch & release in Zone 1	
		The observation was made that some areas in outer islands are being proposed as Z2 as fly fishing is already an activity in these areas and this is not allowable in Z1 in current draft AAT.	
		It was pointed out that there is proposed development on Poivre which is not as per comments for the area that state that there are no plans for development on the island.	
		There was majority agreement from TWG members for the MSP to integrate with the Outer Islands Project for these project sites (7i, 8b, 10b and 7d).	
		One member did not agree to Z2 in these islands as fly-fishing is allowable in these areas and survival rates after the fish is released is reduced as well as productivity.	

Agenda Item #	Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
		Concerns were raised pertaining to the Amirantes area as Z1 and no that there were no representatives from fishers associations present in the meeting. A query was made as to whether there will be further consultations with fisher groups after the TWG.	-MSP team will try to meet with FBOA one to one. J.S. -There may be a need to revert to another SC. J.S. -Fishers association of Praslin and La Digue to provide input on Sat. H.S.
		The concern was raised that compared to milestone 1 and 2, milestone 3 is more fine scale and that there is a need to ensure that the representatives are in the room when discussing these small scale areas.	Stakeholder engagement process – MSP stakeholders to identify zoning design then for core team to move to specific stakeholders. J.S.
		A suggestion was made for Farquhar outer to be Z2 as Seychelles has a petroleum interest in this area (A10). It was advised that the MSP team to check the boundaries for an agreement for Z1 inside this area. These include seismic surveys for petroleum interest and to define the continental shelf to Madagascar.	The interest is documented on the MSP layers to inform the zoning design. J.S.
		It was pointed out that Bird Island is being proposed as a Z1 and that the Z1 area proposed overlaps with an area where there is a petroleum agreement at this point in time and which will extend to the next 3 years.	MSP core team can clip the proposed area to exclude the area in the agreement. J.S.
		There was a reminder that group discussions in the milestone 3 inception was to consider the zoning design and the ease of enforcement with a N/S configuration as opposed to Z1 within a Z2 (Amirantes and Farquhar).	J.S.
		Concerns were raised on the activities in the outer islands and the lack of information on these areas to make decisions pertaining to use, sustainability, catch and release, owners of hotels, economic values.	Revenue by island has been requested in past. JS.
		It was pointed out that the OIP is developing business plans for the islands in the OI project and these may close some of these gaps. IDC	MSP has requested for a copy of IDC

Agenda Item #	Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
		development plans can also guide future developments.	development plan. H.S.
		Members were informed that studies funded by SeyCCAT will look at catch and release on few species in Alphonse and seabird tagging (sooty tern) on Bird Island and Farquhar. The data can be shared with the MSP team.	Timelines may be beyond the MSP planning process but can feed into the review periods of the MSP. H.S.
		It was mentioned that in the milestone 3 inception about the concern for the amount of <i>Siganus</i> , or rabbitfish being sold and the query as to whether they were being caught during spawning aggregations.	<i>Siganus</i> can be caught away from the spawning aggregation but depends on the time of year. This concern has been raised in management plan of Mahe plateau to introduce measures for management of fishing around Spawning aggregation periods. VL.
		A suggestion was made that fly-fishing is already ongoing on outer islands and that it may be best to make it allowable in a Z1 or to make these areas a Z2 and to focus on the other areas for a Z1.	Set access protocols and procedures (set number of rods) are in place for the fly fishing activities in the outer islands and needs to be considered. The concern of equity has been raised at the onset of the MSP. H.S.
		The long term sustainability (financial and environmental) needs to be considered in making these decisions.	
		It was pointed out that revenue from tourism and fly-fishing are used (CSR) to fund conservation activities in these islands and not allowing fly-fishing would hinder that and the environmental management of the island(s).	

Agenda Item #	Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
		The concern was raised that the outer islands are not open to everyone and that there are challenges for marketing for these islands which is limited to one company.	
		The fly-fishing is very seasonal with overbooking in the peak season and more or less empty in other season. Promoting other activities at the other times of the year would be advantageous.	MSP team to confirm the fly-fishing season period. JS.
		There was a concern that all the outer islands are being considered as Z2 due to fly fishing and hotel developments and that the MSP is not considering terrestrial protected areas to restrict activity. Hence, ecologically we may not have any Z1 in the outer islands.	
4.1	Milestone 3 Zoning: Review draft climate change risk mapping and chlorophyll-a	An overview of the High Resolution Sea Surface Temperature (SST) and Chlorophyll-a mapping was provided to the TWG and the context for the MSP to develop SMART objectives for CC.	
4.2	Break out groups to draft Allowable Activity Tables	<p>The members went into breakout groups to discuss the following;</p> <p>Part 1: do you agree with Allowable activities from milestone 2?</p> <p>6a Platte and 6b Coetivy – Z2 7i- Desroches (shallow) – Z2 8 & 8b Alphonse – Z2 10b Farquhar OIP (shallow) - Z2 12 Cosmoledo and Astove (deep) – Z2</p> <p>Part 2: options for Zone 1 area? Ideas!</p> <p>2a Bird (shallow & deep) 5 Mascarene (deep) 7e Etoile (shallow) 7f Boudeuse (shallow) 10a Farquhar (Providence, Cerf) (shallow) 12b Cosmoledo (shallow) 16 Coco de Mer (deep)</p> <p>Other questions to address:</p> <p>-Fly-fishing and Catch & release in Z1 Or -Fly-fishing and Catch & release only in Z2</p>	

Agenda Item #	Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
5.1	Plenary discussions of issues and challenges – suggestions, recommendations and next steps	The groups presented their main points discussed in break out groups. The points for Part 1 are summarised below.	
	Grp 1	<p>For All zone 2 areas proposed in Q–</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -fisheries same as milestone 2, infrastructure & renewable resources same but -Non-renewable resources, methane gas exploration should be considered same as petroleum (as per mining act). -For tourism & recreation anchorage, mooring buoys and motorised act remove C2. All others in tourism & recreation same as milestone 2. -Research Geographical surveys to hydrographic surveys remove C9 as NA. 	
	Grp 2	<p>For all four Z2 islands proposed.</p> <p>All AAT same as milestone 2 table.</p> <p>Same comments as group 1 regarding non-renewable resources and the methane considered same as petroleum.</p> <p>Same comments as group 1 to remove C9 as it applies only to Z1.</p>	
	Grp 3	<p>For all Z2 islands proposed no aquaculture should be allowed.</p> <p>All others same.</p> <p>Agree to remove C9 from research as per G1 and G2.</p> <p>No petroleum activities (other than bioprospecting) should be allowable for all except 10b.</p> <p>All others remain the same.</p>	
		Part 2 comments were summarised as follows;	
	Grp 1	2a – Bird as Z1 – high density of artisanal fishery there but can use North of Bird. Need further discussions with artisanal fishermen if keep as Z1.	

Agenda Item #	Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
		<p>7f Boudeuse and 7e Etoile – Z1. No significant commercial activities there.</p> <p>10a - Farquhar (Providence, Cerf). Can be designated as Z1 as shallow so not affecting petroleum and big game fishing as shallow water. Not clear if there is fly fishing in this area.</p> <p>12b Cosmoledo- Z1 as high biodiversity but already have fly fishing established and airstrip development so needs more discussion if kept Z1.</p> <p>Coco de Mer- Could be Z1 but used by Purse Seine FAD fishing and needs discussion with ITF.</p>	
	Grp 2	<p>2a Bird Z1- 12nm circle design.</p> <p>5 Mascarene – keep Z1 and reduce the size and keep most eastern side as Z1 as unique geological feature. Add removed area from 5 to the 10a Providence as Z1 (but needs to be consulted with PetroSeychelles to avoid their area of interest). Few other economic activity in 10a.</p> <p>Etoile 7e, Boudeuse 7f and Cosmoledo 12b as Z1.</p> <p>Coco de mer 16 kept as Z1 but reduced to meet missing deep water areas.</p>	
	Grp 3	<p>2a Bird Z1 – artisanal and subsistence fishing around the island remains a concern.</p> <p>7e Etoile and 7f Boudeuse Z1 as important seabird colonies and not much other activities in area.</p> <p>Cosmoledo 12b as Z1 important biodiversity seabird area and coral reefs.</p> <p>Farquhar 10a Z2- already has fishing activities there.</p> <p>Suggest to include 7c D’arros and St Joseph 7c as Z1 as permanent resident manta ray population</p>	

Agenda Item #	Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
		and important nursery for sharks in St Joseph. However clients go over from Desroches for fly fishing.	
6	Wrap-up and next steps.	<p>Members were informed that open workshops on Mahe and Praslin will be held on 29 and 30 March 2019.</p> <p>The content of the presentations was discussed as well as the zoning design options that will be presented.</p> <p>The placeholder for next MSP SC is 2nd April 2019 but depends on the outcome of workshops.</p>	
	Meeting adjourned at hrs 3:30 hrs		

Minutes submitted by: Helena Sims on 17 May 2019

Annex I: Meeting Agenda

SEYCHELLES MARINE SPATIAL PLAN (MSP) INITIATIVE

MSP Technical Working Group 10

Monday 25 March 2019

8:30 AM – 3:30 PM

Location: STC Conference Room

Draft Agenda

Meeting Objectives:

- Discuss specific topics pertaining to priority areas for Milestone 3 as discussed in the inception workshop (21st March);
- Discuss and draft Allowable Activity Tables and management considerations for Milestone 3 areas;
- Review draft climate risk mapping/coral threat mapping for climate change adaptation

#	Time	Topic
	8:30	Registration
1	9:00	Workshop Opening – MSP Core Team <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Welcome and Agenda Review • Introductions and roundtable sector updates
2	9:15	MSP Updates: Milestone 2, Governance Arrangements, Costing Analysis, and others
3	9:30	Milestone 3 Launch <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Timeline and Outputs for Milestone 3 • Summary of Milestone 3 Launch Workshop (21 Mar 2019) • TWG 10 discussion and input on zoning design
	10:00	Coffee/Tea break
4	10:20	Milestone 3 Zoning <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Plenary: Review draft climate change risk mapping and chlorophyll-a • Break out groups to draft Allowable Activity Tables
	12:00	Lunch
5	1:00	Milestone 3 zoning options <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Break out groups cont'd and summary presentations of draft Allowable Activity Tables • Plenary discussions of issues and challenges – suggestions, recommendations and next steps • Discussion of Zone 3 – Multiple Uses
6	3:20	Wrap-up and next steps.
	3:30	Adjourn

Annex II: List of documents provided for the meeting.

SEYMSP_TWG9_Minutes_3Oct2018_20181002
SEYMSP_ActivitiesTable_Phase2_Map4.3_Zone2_20181102
SEYMSP_Productivity x Thermal Stress_12Mar2019
SEYMSP_TWG10_ActivitiesTable_Blank_20190325
SEYMSP_TWG10_ActivitiesTable_Other_20190325
SEYMSP_ZoneStatsSummaryTables_Map5.0_20190312
SEYMSP_ZoningDesign_Comments_Map5.0_20190312
SEYMSP_ZoningDesign_Revisions_Map5.0_v2_20190312
SEYMSP_ActivitiesTable_Phase2_Map4.3_Codes_20181031
SEYMSP_ActivitiesTable_Phase2_Map4.3_GenIMgmt_20181102
SEYMSP_ActivitiesTable_Phase2_Map4.3_Zone1_20181112