
MSP Technical Working Group 11

Tuesday 23 July 2019

9:00 AM – 12:00 PM

Location: STC Conference Room

Minutes

Meeting Objectives:

- Discuss and draft Allowable Activity Tables and management considerations for Milestone 3 areas;
- Discuss allowable Activities for Zone 3 areas

Member Attendance:

Alain de Comarmond- MEECC- Chair of MSP SC
Amina Furneau- S4S- Tourism TWG
Amit Wasseberg- SHTA- Tourism TWG
Daig Romain- GoS-UNDP-GEF PA Project- Finance & Implementation TWG
Elke Talma – PCU – Marine ecology TWG
Errol Renaud- SEC- Energy & infrastructure TWG
Holger Anlauf- UniSey- Marine Ecology TWG
Gilberte Gendron- Seychelles National Parks Authority- Marine Ecology TWG
Jean-Luc Mondon – PetroSeychelles – Energy & infrastructure TWG
John Nevill- Independent Consultant- Fisheries TWG
Lindsay Chong-Seng- Plant Conservation Action Group- Terrestrial Ecology TWG
Louis Desnousse- MTCAM- Tourism TWG
Melissa Joseph- SFA- Observer
Michelle Murray- Financing & Implementation TWG
Pierre-Andre Adam- ICS- Marine Ecology TWG
Rabia Somers – MCSS – Representative for Dr David Rowat- Marine Ecology TWG
Sabrena Lawrence- SWIOFISH3- Fisheries TWG
Sindu Parekh- Hire craft Association Seychelles- Tourism & Fisheries TWG
Sophie Morel- MEECC- Terrestrial Ecology TWG
Stuart Laing- UniSey- Finance TWG
Terrence Athanase- Seychelles National Parks Authority - Terrestrial Ecology TWG
Wilna Accouche- Green Islands Foundation – Fisheries TWG
Vania Robert- Seychelles Conservation & Climate Adaptation Trust– Finance & Implementation TWG
Veronica Uzice- SFA- Representative for Aubrey Lucas- Fisheries TWG
Vincent Lucas- Seychelles Fishing Authority – Fisheries TWG

MSP Core Team

Helena Sims- MSP Project Manager, TNC Africa
Joanna Smith- MSP Science & Process lead, TNC Canada

Minutes;

Agenda Item #	Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
1.0	Opening	The MSP core team opened the technical working group meeting #11 and welcomed all participants to the meeting.	
1.1	Agenda Review	The agenda was reviewed and adopted without any changes	See Annex I for adopted agenda.
1.2	Review minutes from TWG10	A review of the minutes of the last meeting held on 25 March 2019 followed. The minutes were approved without any further changes.	
1.3	Action items discussed during minutes review.		
1.4	Participant package components	A review of the composition of the participant package was carried out	See annex II of the participant package list of documents.
1.5	Roundtable updates from TWG members	There was a roundtable of introduction of all members present.	
2.1	MSP Zoning Design: Proposals for remaining 4% of zoning design: Stakeholder input received for Milestone 3 Inception Workshops and Consultations	An overview of the stakeholder input received for Milestone 3 Inception Workshops and Consultations to date was provided to the participants.	
2.2	Presentation of proposals for zoning design V5.1 and V5.2, with rationale and summary info	The TWG participants were presented with the zoning designs V5.1 and V5.2 and the stakeholder comments and areas of agreement.	
		A query was raised on whether the MSP will address activities that include the collection of Birds eggs.	MSP can make mention of foraging areas of birds but the actual activity being on the land is beyond the scope of the MSP. J.S.
		The point was raised that the people who collect the bird's eggs fish around the islands.	The AA around the islands that address subsistence fishing would apply. J.S.
2.3	TWG member discussion of v5.1 and 5.2 by key areas in	Stakeholder feedback on V5.1 and V5.2 deep water areas were presented to the TWG members and the new Aldabra East area	

	<p>zoning design and other options:</p> <p>a. Deep water: Coco de Mer, Mascarene, extending Aldabra Group (Area 6) eastward</p>	<p>proposed. Further discussions were held on these areas in group work and plenary (See 4.0)</p>	
2.4	African Banks	<p>The zoning of the ocean area around African Banks was discussed. There was a proposal for Z1 around African Banks. This would be 0.001%</p>	
		<p>A comment was made that the African Banks previously had 2 islands and now there seems to be only 1. The area is very dynamic and though the sand bank still is there, the island is changing.</p>	
		<p>A query was made on whether the areas within the designated Protected Areas Act be included as a Z1?</p>	<p>Through to the HWM is being proposed as a Z1. JS.</p>
		<p>TWG members from the Fisheries Authority pointed out that African banks is quite popular with the artisanal fishermen and the MSP would need input from them.</p>	
		<p>TWG members from the Hire craft association were not in agreement as the boundary is over the drop-off area. The boundary would need to exclude the 20m drop.</p>	<p>MSP limited by the bathymetry contour resolution to determine drop-off. JS.</p>
		<p>The rationale of having a zone 1 in African Banks was questioned.</p>	
		<p>It was pointed out that the African Banks is the closest outer islands to get to from Mahe and is highly used by fishers, fly fishing and sea cucumber fishermen.</p>	
		<p>A proposal was made to close somewhere south of Amirantes as African Banks is high use.</p>	<p>There are other options Southern Amirantes as Z1 which are being presented. J.S.</p>
		<p>The MSP core team requested feedback on the proposal to designate the African Banks existing boundary as a Z1.</p>	
		<p>A query was made as to who would manage the African Banks areas as it is uninhabited.</p>	<p>Implementation plan of the MSP is being developed and this would</p>

			apply to all proposed Z1. It is less costly to manage a Z1 than a Z2. JS.
		Members questioned if the area is moved west whether it would capture the trench?	The size of the area would become too big to include the trench. The trench can be picked up separately. JS.
2.5	Amirantes South	A query was made as to why Marie-Louise is not included in the Amirantes South proposal?	Tourism, fly fishing area, tourism accommodation on the island. JS.
2.6	D'Arros and St Joseph	Queries were raised on D'Arros which is private and who seem willing to achieve PA status, and whether it would be proposed as a Z1 as in this sense D'Arros is a low hanging fruit as a Z1	Only the terrestrial component is private. The marine area is not and needs stakeholder consultation process for any zoning proposals. HS.
		TWG members questioned whether there are any other Manta ray aggregation areas other the D'Arros?	Also Denis, Marie-Louise.
		It was pointed out that all Mobulids (manta rays) should be protected and not associated to a particular critical habitat.	
		Clarification was sought as to why there no high support for D'Arros and St Joseph and if it is associated with any past political decisions.	No high stakeholder agreement for D'Arros and St Joseph through the MSP process to date. J.S.
		A query was made as to why catch and release is not allowable in a Z1?	Low scientific support of sustainability of catch and release and high agreement for equity for commercial activities in a Z1.
		Concerns were raised that D'Arros would use the protection status (Z1 proposal) to exclude	Each area will have a management plan and conditions that

		access to waters around the island including diving.	will address right of access. AD.
		A query was made on the shark feeding activities around D'Arros and if that is an allowable activity in the Seychelles.	Shark feeding is not an allowable activity under the Fisheries Act.
3.1	Break out groups	<p>There were 4 breakout groups to discuss the following;</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Options for expanding the area 13 – Aldabra group Options for Z1 areas in Amirantes <ul style="list-style-type: none"> African Banks Amirantes South: Etoile, Boudeuse Marie-Louise, Desnouefs Bird island and/or North Drop-off Allowable Activities Table for zone 1 and zone 2 Area based management considerations for proposed areas 	
4.0	Group reporting and plenary	A summary of each group report is provided below;	
4.1	G1	<p>Amirantes: African Banks agree with last proposal for Z1 as per minutes.</p> <p>Amirantes South proposal no objections for the proposals. Need to ensure SW and W border is up to the 20m drop (does not include 20m+ as this is high use for hire craft + artisanal fishing activities).</p> <p>Deep water area options: Aldabra preferred option of the 3.13% but need to ensure McLeod and Bulldog bank and Wizard reef in Z2 not Z1.</p> <p>Members of the group requested clarity on definition of subsistence fishing and who can do this activity. In reference to subsistence fishing on boats and whether it applies to crew and boats.</p>	
	Comments	Existing subsistence fishing currently applies only to terrestrial applications managing outer islands. Agree that crew and boats move outside the Z1 areas to fish.	
	Comments	A concern was raised that there is no spatial representation for the Sports fishing	Up to 16km from the drop-off. JS.

4.2	G2	<p>Amirantes: African banks: recommend as a Z2.</p> <p>D'Arros to Poivre: Area 7k should be a zone 1 as high biodiversity value.</p> <p>Amirantes: The shape of the Z1 in Amirantes to be made square for easier management. Add Marie-Louise as a Z1.</p> <p>Deep water area options: In favour for the Aldabra group (Area 13) to be extended to the East to the 2.5% option as meets area target and geomorphology features.</p> <p>Members of the group prefer to keep Coco de mer and Mascarene as Z1 or Z2. If met Z1 target through Aldabra extension, can make them a Z2. Should not be a Z3 as the areas have a high biodiversity value</p>	
4.3	G3:	<p>Amirantes: D'Arros: Merit of including D'Arros & St Joseph 7C as Z1 due to high biodiversity on the condition that African Banks is a Z2.</p> <p>Deep water area options: V5.1 preferred as these areas capture the representative habitats. Members of the group felt there is a lack of biodiversity information to make an informed decision but feel there is more known in these 2 areas. Not in favour of Aldabra extension proposal as Z1 as eliminates the other 2 options and lack of replication across the EEZ.</p>	
	Comments	These were different levels of agreement with respect to the African banks Vs D'Arros St Joseph.	
4.4	Group 4	<p>Amirantes- African banks: take 7a, 7j, 7b and mirror image this/flip it westwards to provide drop off for fishermen and keep the drop-off on the west for protection.</p> <p>Propose D'Arros as a Z1 (7c).</p>	

		<p>Amirantes South: Area 7e, f, g, m, box all the areas but avoid fisheries areas for artisanal and big game fishers and capture the patch reef (brown feature). A square configuration would be easier to manage.</p> <p>Deep water area option: Prefer the Aldabra East extension- 3.1% option if give up Coco de Mer and Mascarene provided no concern with other stakeholders such as fisheries.</p> <p>Also propose to extend South as there are many features in South to pick up in that area that would be lost from Coco de mer and Mascarene. This may be problematic for petroleum and fisheries.</p>	
5.0	Next steps	<p>Discussions will be brought to the MSP SC including Bird island proposals. With approval from the MSP SC and EC, the zoning design will be revised and a further round of consultations will be held in Sept/Oct 2019.</p>	
<i>Meeting adjourned at 1202 hrs</i>			

Minutes submitted by: Helena Sims on 24 July 2019

Annex I: Meeting Agenda

SEYCHELLES MARINE SPATIAL PLAN (MSP) INITIATIVE

MSP Technical Working Group 11

Tuesday 23 July 2019

9:00 AM – 12:00 PM

Location: STC Conference Room

Draft Agenda

Meeting Objectives:

- Discuss and draft Allowable Activity Tables and management considerations for Milestone 3 areas;
- Discuss allowable Activities for Zone 3 areas

#	Time	Topic
	8:30	Registration
1	9:00	Workshop Opening – Dr. Joanna Smith and Ms. Helena Sims <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Welcome and Agenda Review • Introductions and roundtable sector updates • Review of action items from minutes TWG #10
2	9:15	MSP Zoning Design: Proposals for remaining 4% of zoning design <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i) Stakeholder input received for Milestone 3 Inception Workshops and Consultations ii) Presentation of proposals for zoning design V5.1 and V5.2, with rationale and summary info iii) TWG member discussion of v5.1 and 5.2 by key areas in zoning design and other options: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Deep water: Coco de Mer, Mascarene, extending Aldabra Group (Area 6) eastward b. Amirantes: African Banks, Etoile, Boudeuse, Marie Louise, Desnouefs c. Bird Island and north drop-off
	10:15	Coffee/Tea break
3	10:30	MSP Zoning Design: Allowable Activities Tables and Area-based Management Considerations <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Break out groups to draft Allowable Activity Tables for new areas proposed • Review, discuss and revise Area-based Management Considerations
4	11:20	Group reporting and plenary
	12:00	Lunch provided

Annex II: List of documents provided for the meeting

SEYMSP_ActivitiesTable_Milestone3_Map5.2_Codes_20190716
SEYMSP_ActivitiesTable_Milestone3_Map5.2_GenMgmt_20190716
SEYMSP_ActivitiesTable_Milestone3_Map5.2_Zone1_20190716
SEYMSP_ActivitiesTable_Milestone3_Map5.2_Zone2_20190716
SEYMSP_WS22_ZoningDesign_Groups_Map5.0_20190321_v2

SEYMSP_ZoneStats_Map_51_52_20190716
SEYMSP_ZoningDesign_Revisions_Map5.2_v1_20190716
Zoning_Design_V52_Amirantes_Group_Bathymetry_16July2019
Zoning_Design_V52_Amirantes_Group_ShallowGeomor_16July2019