

SEYCHELLES MARINE SPATIAL PLANNING (MSP) INITIATIVE

MSP Stakeholder Workshop
Milestone 3 Inception Workshop
MSP Workshop #22
Thursday 21 March 2019
8:30 AM – 3:30 PM
Location : Savoy Hotel, Beau-Vallon, Mahé

Minutes

Meeting Objectives:

1. Updates on completion of Milestone 2
2. To launch Milestone 3 and discuss options for completion of zoning design

Present:

Amia Jovanovic-Desir – Seychelles Tourism Board
Andy Rylance- GoS-UNDP-GEF Protected Areas Finance Project
Angelique Pouponneau- Seychelles Conservation and Climate Adaptation Trust
Bernice Senaratne- Department of Tourism
Chris Mason-Parker- Global Vision International
Cynthia Adrienne- Ministry of Habitat, Infrastructure, and Land Transport
Daniella Payet-Allis – Seychelles Sustainable Tourism Foundation
Danielle Juipter- SWIOFISH3 Programme
David Rowat - Marine Conservation Society Seychelles
Elke Talma- Programme Coordination Unit
Emmanuel Chassot- Independent Tuna Fisheries Expert
Errol Renaud- Seychelles Energy Commission
Gilberte Gendron- Seychelles National Parks Authority
Jan Robinson- SWIOFISH3 Programme
Jennifer Jasmin- Ministry of Finance, Trade, Investment and Economic Planning
Joachim Valmont - Seychelles Maritime Safety Administration
Johan Mendez- Adaptation Fund Project
Johnny Louys- Seychelles Fishing Authority
Laura Blamey- University of Seychelles
Lindsay Chong-Seng-Plant Conservation Action Group
Manuela Alcaniz- Seychelles Suba Diver Federation
Marie-May Muzungaila– Ministry of Environment, Energy and Climate Change
Peter Brinn- GCCA+ (Component A) Project
Peter Purvis- Industrial Tuna Fisheries Purse Seine Representatives
Rodney Govinden- Seychelles Fishing Authority
Sabrena Lawrence – SWIOFISH3 Programme
Sharif Antoine- Seychelles Fishing Authority
Vania Robert - Seychelles Conservation and Climate Adaptation Trust
Vincent Lucas- Seychelles Fishing Authority

Wilna Accouche- Green Islands Foundation

MSP Core Team:

Joanna Smith - Science and Process lead, Seychelles MSP initiative, TNC Canada

Helena Sims - Project Manager, Seychelles MSP initiative, TNC

Minutes;

Agenda Item Number	Agenda Item	Notes/Comments/Advice	Action_Response (with initials for who provides response)
1.1 1.2	Welcome & opening	A short welcome was delivered by the MSP Core Team and an overview of the Packet Content was provided.	Annex 1 for documents provided.
1.3	Agenda Review	The agenda was review and adopted without any changes.	Annex 2 for agenda.
1.4	Round-table of introductions	There was a round table of introductions of members present in the meeting.	
2.1	MSP Updates; Nomination file	Members present were informed that the nomination file for the MSP milestone 2 areas was submitted to GoS on 30 th November 2018. The notice of intent to gazette was published on 29 th January 2019. The next steps are to officially gazette the boundaries and the signing of designation order.	
2.2	Other MSP updates	Members were informed that the MSP team met with the Executive Committee on Tuesday 19 th March 2019.	
		The representative of the PA Finance Project informed members that the first workshop for the MSP Costing analysis for the implementation was held in February 2019. The work is to be finalised within Q2 of 2019.	
		The MEECC provided an updated that the MSP governance framework is being finalised and is to be presented to the Cabinet of Ministers in April 2019. Currently meetings are being held with DPA and MFTEP to make coherence with Government and Parastatal salary bands as the authority will be budget dependent.	
		Members were informed by TNC that there is an ongoing pilot for Electronic monitoring on Purse Seine and longline vessels (6 vessels).	
		Members were updated that information was provided to Nekton for the selection of priority areas for the research cruises.	
3.1	Outputs, timeline and workplan	A review of the milestone 2 areas was provided to members which total 350,000 sq km.	

		<p>The schedule of MSP stakeholder meetings for March to April 2019 was presented to the members and include:</p> <p>Tue 19 Mar- Executive Committee Meeting #14</p> <p>Thu 21 Mar- MSP Workshop #22 for Inception Milestone 3: <i>EC, SC, TWG members</i></p> <p>Mon 25 Mar- Technical Working Group Meeting #10</p> <p>Fri 29 Mar- Public Workshop Mahe (Workshop #23)</p> <p>Sat 30 Mar - Public Workshop Praslin/La Digue (on Praslin) (Workshop #24)</p> <p>Tue 2 Apr - Steering Committee Meeting #15 (TBC)</p> <p>Thu 4 Apr- Executive Committee Meeting #15</p> <p>Bilaterals; TWG Fisheries, TWG Ecology: Climate Change, ICS, GIF and others.</p>	
		<p>A review of the debt swap milestones and timelines was presented. Members were informed that the MSP is ahead of the final milestone with 4% remaining. The next MSP milestones summarised as;</p> <p>EEZ is 1,349,093 km²</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Total Goal is 30% or 404,727 km² - Milestone 1 + 2 = 26% or 350,764 km² - Milestone 3 = 4% or <i>approx.</i> 54,000 km² <p>By Representation, by Area:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Within 12 nautical miles is 3.5% of EEZ → 30% is ~ 1.05% or <i>approx.</i> 14,000 km² - Deep water remaining is 3% or <i>approx.</i> 40,000 km² <p>By Zone:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Zone 1 & 2: 27,000 km² each 	
3.2	Methodology to develop options for Milestone 3	<p>The approach to developing the options for milestone 3 was presented to participants including new information on Climate Change (CC) risk mapping and building blocks of 1km boundaries from the reef.</p>	Annex 3
		<p>A summary of the issues and challenges for the MSP was provided.</p>	Annex 4

		<p>A summary of the advice from milestone 1 and 2 was provided to inform milestone 3. The advice is quite varied for the remaining areas to be considered.</p> <p>The information informing the different zone categories for the different areas was also presented.</p>	
3.3	Climate change risk mapping for coral reefs and chlorophyll-a primary productivity mapping	A presentation on the Climate change risk mapping for coral reefs and chlorophyll-a primary productivity mapping was provided to all members.	
		It was pointed out that recent studies in Seychelles have shown that high temporal variability in certain areas increases the resilience of coral reefs. The work is ongoing with UniSey and SFA.	To send contact names to MSP core team. EC
		It was brought to the attention of the members that there is no published work to compare SST anomaly data sets to actual coral bleaching events. In addition, the dataset presented has the 2016 bleaching year included. It was suggested that it would be good to compare the 2016 year to the coral bleaching monitoring data sets that Seychelles has (pre and post bleaching surveys in Seychelles).	MSP core team to contact MCSS and GVI for the data.
		An observation was made that the data doesn't reflect the upwelling areas in the west.	
		It was commented that the scale of the data used and its application to small spatial scales (coral reefs) is questionable and that it would be challenging to use this to predict where corals bleach. It was proposed that it is best to focus on reef resilience and coral recovery post bleaching.	

<p>4.1</p>	<p>Milestone 3 zoning options: Overview of proposed options</p>	<p>Two zoning design options were presented in the inception workshop; Option 1 using replication and spacing of zone 1 across the archipelago. Remove Coco de Mer Remove Mascarene Inner Islands:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - East Zone 2 - West Zone 3 (* need more info) <p>North Drop off:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Bird Zone 1 - Denis Zone 2 - Deep water Zone 2 <p>Amirantes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Deep water Zone 1 - Atolls (1 km) Zone 2 <p>Platte Zone 1 Coetivy Zone 2 Alphonse:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - All Zone 2 <p>Farquhar:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Deep water Zone 1 - Atolls (1 km) Zone 2 <p>Cosmoledo and Astove:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Atolls (1 km) Zone 1 - Deep water Zone 2 <p>Option 2 avoiding most high use areas in shallow water for Z1 (low representation in shallow water) but representation and spacing across the corners of the EEZ.</p> <p>Coco de Mer Zone 1 Mascarene Zone 1 Inner Islands</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - West Zone 3 (* need more info) <p>North Drop off:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - All Zone 2 <p>Amirantes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 6/10 atolls (1 km) Zone 1 - Deep water Zone 2 <p>Platte Zone 2 Coetivy Zone 2 Alphonse:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - All Zone 2 <p>Farquhar:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Providence (1 km) Zone 1 - Deep water Zone 2 <p>Cosmoledo and Astove:</p>	
------------	---	--	--

		- All Zone 2	
		Members were reminded that North Island have a nomination file prepared from the PA Expansion Project.	MSP core team to include this. JS. HS.
		Questions were raised regarding proposals for Z1 on the Mahe plateau as the plateau is earmarked as a sustainable use area.	The rationale for making a zone 1 as Bird and Denis are the only sand cay in the inner islands, replication of granitic reefs in Z1 is needed and identification of shark nursery areas. J.S.
4.2	Milestone 3 zoning options: Break out groups to discuss options and identify issues and challenges	<p>The members broke out into groups with objectives to;</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Propose areas for Z1 2. Propose areas for Z2 3. Record comments, issues, concerns, rationale, areas of agreement. <p>Additional information provided for the group work included;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -GeoPDF with data layers -Area maps on the tables -MSP atlas -Content of the participant package 	
5.1	Milestone 3 zoning options : Summary from break out groups	There was a summary of the group discussions which was made in plenary and summarised in Annex V & VI.	
	General comments from Group 1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - For outer islands there should be bed limits for any new developments and there should include a requirement for fund allocation from these development to PAs. -For islands with no current development plans they should remain pristine an undeveloped. -Z2 allocation for Outer Islands with fly-fishing activity. It was proposed to make this activity allowable in these areas and make them a Z1. - Propose to create a Z1 around OI with special features with a buffer of Z2. 	

5.2	Milestone 3 zoning options: Plenary discussion of Milestone 3 zoning design options	A query was made pertaining to input from Dr. Chris Feare and Sooty Terns data in Seychelles.	MSP Core team confirmed that has provided telemetry data from projects and foraging habitats. JS.
		Queries were made on the allowable activities (AA) in Z1 and the ease of enforcement in future should different tables be developed for different areas in Z1. The concern was also raised that decisions are currently being developed on the Zones based on the known AA in these areas (e.g. catch and release).	Recommendations on allowable activities will be discussed further but at the same time there is a need to consider existing uses and present these to the EC for recommendations. JS
		A comment was made based on the bed limit recommendation for OI. There was a bed limit of 50 rooms per island. This limit will now be determined by individual EIAs for each development proposal.	
		A comment was made that the carrying capacity assessment for these EIA are not done due to lack of capacity.	
		Members present were informed that the MSP core team will compile the information to present further proposals in the next round of stakeholder consultations.	
6	Other MSP Updates		
	Economic valuation assessment of Seychelles Tuna Fisheries	Members were reminded that MSP commissioned a socio-economic assessment of Industrial Tuna Fisheries, with financial support from TNC. The consultants, represented by Dr Emmanuel Chassot (& Patrice Gullotreau and Boris Gastrineau) gave an overview of the analysis and the results.	
	Q&A of economic evaluation report	There was a query regarding whether fish oil and fish meal value was included in the analysis.	Activity minor compared to macroeconomic activity. To check and revert. EC.
		Members were advised that this exercise for the economic analysis for (marine) tourism will also be carried out.	

		A query was made on when will the analysis be made public.	The report/analysis is currently under internal peer review and a presentation will be made to the MFAg and SFA. The MSP will provide an update on public distribution as soon as possible. JS.
		Clarification was sought on the estimate of the impact using milestone 2 areas. Note: The opinion was made that the message that the MSP closed areas has minimal impact on the Industrial Tuna industry should be made public.	This analysis showed that the effect was minimal. The IOTC resolutions are more of a concern at this point in time for the industry. EC.
		It was pointed out that access to these types of data and sharing of the data is important and a requirement and that this may be improved with the FITI.	
		A query was made on whether data from other processors (sea harvest, Oceania etc.) was provided to SFA?	SFA has good access to the data but capacity to process the data is the limitation. EC.
7	Wrap up and next steps	Minutes to be drafted and TWG meeting is on Monday 25 th March at 0900hrs.	
<i>Meeting adjourned at hrs 1535hrs</i>			

Minutes submitted by: Helena Sims on 30 April 2019

Annex I: Documents provided for the meeting

SEYMSP_Draft_Zoning_Design_Option1_V50_12Mar2019
SEYMSP_Draft_Zoning_Design_Option2_V50_12Mar2019
SEYMSP_Productivity x Thermal Stress_12Mar2019
SEYMSP_ZoneStatsSummaryTables_Map5.0_20190312
SEYMSP_ZoningDesign_Comments_Map5.0_20190312
SEYMSP_ZoningDesign_Revisions_Map5.0_v2_20190312
SEYMSP_ZoningDesign_Template_Map5.0_20190312
SEYMSP_ActivitiesTable_Phase2_Map4.3_Codes_20181031
SEYMSP_ActivitiesTable_Phase2_Map4.3_Zone1_20181112
SEYMSP_ActivitiesTable_Phase2_Map4.3_Zone2_20181102

Annex 2: Agenda

SEYCHELLES MARINE SPATIAL PLAN (MSP) INITIATIVE

MSP Stakeholder Workshop

Milestone 3 Inception Workshop

MSP Workshop #22

Thursday 21 March 2019

8:30 AM – 3:30 PM

Location: Savoy Hotel, Beau-Vallon, Mahé

Draft Agenda

Meeting Objectives:

3. Updates on completion of Milestone 2
4. To launch Milestone 3 and discuss options for completion of zoning design

#	Time	Topic
	8:00	Registration of Participants
1	8:30	Official Opening of Milestone 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Welcome and Agenda review – Ministry of Environment, Energy and Climate Change• Roundtable introductions and sector updates
2	9:00	MSP Updates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Nomination File Milestone 2• Other MSP updates
3	9:15	Milestone 3 Inception <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Outputs, timeline and workplan• Methodology to develop options for Milestone 3• Climate change risk mapping for coral reefs and chlorophyll-a primary productivity mapping
	10:00	Coffee/Tea break
4	10:30	Milestone 3 zoning options <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Overview of proposed options• Break out groups to discuss options and identify issues and challenges
	12:00	Lunch
5	1:00	Milestone 3 zoning options <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Summary from break out groups• Plenary discussion of Milestone 3 zoning design options
6	2:45	Other MSP Updates
7	3:20	Wrap-up and next steps.
	3:30	Adjourn

Annex III: approach to developing options for Milestone 3

1. MSP Objectives: expand protection, support Blue Economy, climate change adaptation
2. MSP Protection Objective: 30% by area and representation of species and habitats → ~90 biodiversity features
3. MSP Guiding principles: EBM, feasible, enforceable, affordable, practical, precautionary approach
4. MSP Design Principles: Large, contiguous areas best for compliance, MCS, enforcement, management
5. Marine Protection Design Principles: representation, replication, size, spacing, connectivity, rare & unique species and habitats, breeding areas, nurseries
6. Climate change resilience: Replication to safeguard against catastrophe; redundancy; intact food webs
7. Stakeholder comments: 2014-2018
8. Existing Data and Information: biodiversity, oceanography, fisheries, shipping, infrastructure, Marxan, etc.
9. Existing boundaries: maritime zones, fisheries zones, nomination files (e.g., OIP areas, Denis Island)
10. New Activities: Co-management proposals, LNG, sustainable fisheries projects, aquaculture
11. New Information: Climate change risk mapping (threats) and habitat quality (productivity)
12. Building Blocks: Create draft polygons around all atolls to 1 KM reef edge, same as Outer Islands Project

Annex IV: Summary of issues and challenges for the MSP

1. Expanding marine protection in the Inner Islands will be very challenging
 - Existing MPAs and stakeholder concerns about previous consultation → low buy in to comply with fisheries closures
 - Monitoring and enforcement of existing MPAs → regulations, budget for rangers, 24/7 surveillance
 - Existing MPAs and categories in the new legislation → integrating with the MSP
2. Platte and Coetivy – Condition and status of habitats, Fisheries, Tourism
3. Outer Islands – High biodiversity, Tourism and Fisheries (Amirantes, Farquhar, Cosmoledo, Astove)
4. Outer Islands and ‘Allowable Activities Tables’ for Zone 1
 - Are fly fishing and catch & release allowable in Zone 1 areas?
 - Hotel and resort development adjacent to Zone 1 areas?
5. Coco de Mer - Local and foreign fisheries. Seabird foraging habitat. Seamount is outside the EEZ.
6. Mascarene Plateau – Biodiversity, Industrial Tuna Longline, Maritime Security, JMA
7. Discussions with island owners or managers not involved in Milestone 1 or 2
8. Zone 1 areas in deep water – benefits and impacts to fisheries management

Annex V; Summary of breakout group discussions

DRAFT – Break Out Group Notes

Area Name	km ²	% EEZ	Grp 1	Grp 2	Grp3	Grp4	Grp5	Grp6
1a Mahé Plateau Central,	3,190	0.24	3	3	3	2	2	2
1b Mahé Plateau Central,	2,528	0.19	2	3	3	2	2	2
2a Bird Island	1,638	0.12	1-2*	1	2	1	1 & 2	1
2b Denis Island	3,191	0.24	1-2*	2	2	3	2	1
5 Mascarene Ridge N	8,978	0.66	1 or 3	3	1	2	1 & 3	2
6 Amirantes to Fortune Bank	173,468	12.83						

Area Name	km ²	% EEZ	Grp 1	Grp 2	Grp3	Grp4	Grp5	Grp6
6a Platte	2,377	0.18	1-2*	-	2	2	2	2
6b Coetivy	2,950	0.22	2	-	2	2	2	2
7 Amirantes Group	16,662	1.23	1-2*	1 & 2	2	1	2	2
7a African Banks	18	0.001	1-2*	2	1	2	1	2
7b Remire*	21	0.002	1-2*	2	2	2	1	2
7c Darros and St Joseph*	111	0.008	1-2*	2	1	2	2	2
7d Poivre OIP Area	56	0.004	1-2*	1	1	2	1	2
7e Etoile*	19	0.001	1-2*	1	1	2	1	2
7f Boudeuse*	18	0.001	1-2*	1	1	2	1	2
7g Desnoeuvs*	23	0.002	1-2*	1	1	2	2	2
7h Marie-Louise*	25	0.002	1-2*	1	1	2	2	2
7i Desroches OIP Area	333	0.03	1-2*	2	2	2	2	2
8 Alphonse Group	18,935	1.40	2	2	2	-	2	2
8b Alphonse OIP Area	215	0.02	2	2	2	-	2	2
10 Farquhar Outer	12,874	0.95	1-2*	1 & 2	1	1	1	1-2*
10a Providence Cerf St	1,608	0.12	1-2*	1	2	2	1	-
10b Farquhar OIP Area	415	0.03	1-2*	2	2	2	2	2
12 Cosmoledo and Astove	4,903	0.36	2	2	2	2	2	
12b Cosmoledo*	339	0.03	2	1	2	2	1	1
12c Astove*	79	0.01	2	1	2	2	2	
13 Aldabra Group	177,363	13.12						
13a Assumption	83	0.01						
16 Coco de Mer	17,893	1.32	3	1	1	3	2	1
17 Offshore Waters	898,780	66.49						
Zone 1								
Zone 2								

Annex VI: Comments by Area

Area 1 – probably most contentious out of the areas Zone 3 [G3]
Area 1 - large area already activity taking place; fisheries plans being developed [G4]
Area 1a – already high use so Zone 3 [G1]
Area 1b – high productivity and high fisheries; improve management of fishery
Area 1b – Zone 3 high use area [G2]
Area 1a and 1b – Z2 but hotspots within can be Z3 (ports) or Z1 [G4]
Area 1a and 1b – some exceptions certain Z1 and Z2 [G4]
Area 1a and 1b – Zone 2 based on existing MPAs and demersal management plan [G5]
Area 2a – high biodiversity but have artisanal. Need input from fisheries and other users G1]
Area 2a - Z1 to protect the sand cay and sooty tern; or Z2 as existing artisanal fisheries and tourism [G5]
Area 2a and Area 2b – high fishing area [G3]
Area 2a and Area 2b - Bird and Denis Zone 1 – fly fishing allowable in Zone 1 [G6]
Area 2b – sport fishing here [G1]
Area 2b – Zone 3 in shipping lane and Zone 1-2 close to island [G4]
Area 5 – Zone 1 to protect seagrass or Zone 3 as monitoring and enforcement will be costly[G5]
Area 5 – Zone 1 but concerns about JMA and enforcement [G1]
Area 5 - Zone 2 or Zone 1 but reduce the size if Zone 1 and add Zone 1 to Farquhar [G2]
Area 5 – Zone 2; compromise to allow some fishing [G4]
Area 5 - Zone 2 (not enough information on the area) [G6]
Area 6 – island lagoons Zone 1 with Zone 2 buffer [G1]
Area 6a – high fishing activities, proximity to Mahé for smaller vessels [G3]
Area 6a – sustainable use tourism and hotel being built. [G4]
Area 6b – whales? more info needed on importance (temporal closed?). Important for fisheries. [G4]
Area 6a – Zone 2 high artisanal fishery and tourism; high productivity [G5]
Area 7 – (any) islands not yet developed be Zone 1 and no development allowed [G1]
Area 7 – large concern for Zone 1(7d to 7g) here. Propose Z1 in South and Z2 in North [G2]
Area 7 – one policy for all the islands [G3]
Area 7 – needed area for Zone 1; ruby snapper, overfishing, sooty terns [G4]
Area 7 – Zone 2 for monitoring and enforcement [G6]
Area 7 – Zone 2 semi industrial fisheries [G5]
Area 7a – Zone 1 African Banks Z1 – small area [G6]
Area 7a – high productivity value [G3]
Area 7a to 7i – Zone 2; need to check habitats represented elsewhere; fly fishing [G4]
Area 7e-7i – Zone 2 (Etoile, Boudeuse, Desnoeufs, Marie-Louise, Desroches) [G6]
Area 7g and 7h – Zone 2 for economic activity, bird eggs [G5]
Area 8 – fly fishing here unless catch and release allowed in Zone 1 (then could be Z1) [G1]
Area 8 – Zone 2 if want to maintain fly fishing [G5]
Area 8b - Alphonse already proposed as Zone 2 [G1]
Area 10 – connectivity to other regions [G4]
Area 10 - Farquhar Z1 Inner and Z2 outer; Providence did not complete. [G6]
Area 10a – St Pierre Zone 1? Providence Zone 2 [G4]
Area 10a and 10b - Propose an area Z1 bigger in Providence; Farquhar Z2 (see map proposal) [G2]
Area 12 – already developed by IDC; existing fly fishing [G1]
Area 12 – Zone 1 in lagoon (shallow) and Zone 2 outside (deep) [G2]
Area 12 – Zone 2 because of hotels [G4]
Area 12b – Zone 1 with allowing fly fishing [G6]
Area 16 - difficult to enforce, seamount beyond the EEZ and will be fished [G1]

Area 16 – indications Coast Guard is up for monitoring and enforcement [G3]

Area 16 – Zone 3 because overshoot Zone 2 (...percentage) [G4]