
MSP Steering Committee, with Technical Working Groups

Steering Committee #20, with Technical Working Group #13

Date: Friday 15th July 2022

Time: 8:30 AM – 4:00 PM

Location: Eden Bleu Hotel, Mahé

Minutes

Meeting Objectives:

1. To address key issues on Allowable Activities Tables for Zone 1-3
2. To initiate drafting of Zone Management Units, where needed

Attendance:

Ameer Ebrahim - SFA, Steering Committee, Fisheries TWG
Bernice Senaratne- Dept. of Tourism, Steering Committee, Tourism TWG
Chris Mason-Parker - CEO, MCSS - Chairperson, Steering Committee, Marine Ecology TWG
Cynthia Adrienne- GIS Section, MLH, Steering Committee
Denis Matatiken- Co-Chair PS Environment, MACCE, Steering Committee Co-Chair
Lindsay Chong-Seng- PCA Group – Steering Committee, Chair of Terrestrial Ecology TWG
Marie-May Jeremie- CEO, SeyCCAT, Steering Committee, Financing and Implementation TWG
Sylvanna Antat- UniSey, Steering Committee
Wilna Accouche- GIF, Steering Committee, Fisheries TWG
Abel Sorry – BE, Steering Committee
Chris Mason-Parker (Chair) MCSS, Marine Ecology TWG
Annabelle Constance- SIF, Marine Ecology TWG
Stuart Laing- UniSey, Marine Ecology TWG
James Lea- SOSF-DRC, Marine Ecology TWG
Gilberte Gendron- Independent Consultant- Bee Ecological Consulting, Marine Ecology TWG
Alain de Comarmond- Independent consultant, Marine Ecology TWG
Lindsay Chong-Seng PCA, Terrestrial Ecology TWG
Corianna Julie- SIF, Terrestrial Ecology TWG
Didier Dogley- Independent consultant, Terrestrial Ecology TWG
Yohan Mendez- Independent consultant- Terrestrial Ecology TWG
Abel Sorry Blue Economy Department, Fisheries TWG
Rodney Govinden- SFA, Fisheries TWG
Johnny Louys- SFA (CMS), Fisheries TWG
Stefan de Greling- SeyCCAT, Financing and Implementation TWG
Jan Robinson- SWIOFISH3, Steering Committee, Fisheries TWG
Patrick Samson- PetroSeychelles, Steering Committee, Energy & Infrastructure TWG

MSP Core Team

Joanna Smith- Science and Process lead, Seychelles MSP initiative, TNC Canada
Helena Sims- Project Manager, Seychelles MSP initiative, TNC
Sabrina Renaud- MSP Admin Support
Mr. Rick Tingey- GIS spatial analyst, Spatial Support Systems LLC
Ms. Elke Talma- SeyCCAT Project coordinator

Minutes;

Agenda Item #	Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
1.0	Welcome	The Principal Secretary for Environment welcomed all the participants to the meeting.	
1.1	Agenda Review	The agenda of the meeting was reviewed and adopted without any changes.	Annex I
1.2	Participant Packet review	The participant packet was reviewed.	Annex II
1.3	Introductions	There was a round of introductions of meeting participants.	
2.1	SMSP: zoning - implementation	An overview of the zoning to implementation steps to finish the MSP was provided and include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Allowable Activities Tables: Zone 1 - 3 • General Management Considerations • Area-based Management Considerations • Master List of Uses and Activities (Definitions) • Management Units • Spatial Decision Matrix for Oil & Gas (TWG#14) • Zone area maps, if additional information needed for management plans 	
3.10	Outstanding activities to finalise	The outstanding topics needed to finalise the Allowable Activities Tables (AAT) include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Subsistence Fishing – Zone 1 • Sustainable Tourism Criteria – Zone 1 and 2 • Sustainable Fisheries Criteria – Zone 2 • Area based management considerations - Zone 1 and Zone 2 • Allowable Activity Table - Zone 3 	
3.11	Subsistence fishing – zone 1 Definition	There was a plenary discussion on subsistence fishing before the break out sessions. Definition of subsistence fishing: A fishery where the fish caught are shared and consumed directly by the community, families and kin of the fishers but which does not result in the trading, offering for sale or selling of fish (Source: SFA) Subsistence fishing is fishing for personal consumption or traditional/ceremonial purposes (Source: OECD 2001).	

Agenda Item #	Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
		<p>SMSP Code #2: To serve staff, facilities or provide essential infrastructure for the zone, including enforcement. Need quotas and monitoring of any species harvesting. Subsistence is intended to apply only to island residents and non-commercial activities, and does not apply to hotel guests or other commercial activities including paying guests. Needs management plans in some cases (e.g., SIF 2016)</p>	
3.12	Comments from Workshop #32	<p>The comments received on subsistence fishing from workshop#32 were summarised for the SC/TWG members. These include:</p> <p>What:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Original MSP definition was non-commercial oriented • Provide food for guests at resorts, fishing lodges, liveaboard marine charters, fishing boats • Serving locally-caught fish is part of the experience for charters • Subsistence for staff and import fish to serve guests • SFA Committee formed for sport fishing • Are IUCN listed species caught? • Commercial fishing is incompatible with Zone 1 <p>Where and when:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Offshore • Outside Zone 1 • Outer Islands tourism is very important • Boat charters 2 seasons; 20-22 guests per night (Oct-Nov; Mar-Apr) • Amirantes - few charters • Providence - about 100/year • Assomption - 40 people per season <p>How:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Follow a Code of Conduct • Highest protection areas with subsistence fishing - optics • Not reef fish • Quota or limits • Scale of the activity in Outer Islands • Consistent application of regulations • Management Plans • Protect species in specific locations • Permit for fishing for liveaboards or charters and resorts • Challenges for enforcement 	

Agenda Item #	Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
3.13	Plenary: Catch and Release - Zoning	A query was made as to where catch and release is allowable in the SMSP zoning design and the allowable activities table (AAT). There was a concern as to the sustainability of catch and release and the lack of studies on the survival/mortality rates post catch and release.	Catch and release not allowable in a Z1. In Z2 it is allowable. Sustainability criteria for tourism will need to be addressed. Studies that show mortality rates of catch and release to be shared with members. JS., HS. AE.
3.14	Plenary: Catch and Release- Sustainability	SC member representatives from the SFA queried on the sustainability of catch and release and expressed that there are species specific studies to support catch and release and mortality rates. Some reports show that demersal species being caught 4-5 times with high survival rate. The studies to support to the co-management plan of Mahe plateau to be finalised this year.	The SMSP team has minimal evidence for survival rates for different species in Seychelles at this time. JS., HS. SFA to make available reports to SMSP team.
3.15	Plenary: Bird Island Z1	There was a request for a recap as to the classification of Bird island as Zone 1 in the SMSP zoning design.	Bird was identified as a Z1 based on the benthic habitat features including the shelf edge and high relief areas. The boundary design was negotiated with the FBOA and island owners, avoiding the Silhouette bank to allow for artisanal fisheries to continue. The island owners were also in agreement to have a Z1 around Bird island and not have extractive activities within that boundary including Sports & recreational fishing. HS., JS.
3.16	Plenary: Hovercrafts	There was a query on hovercrafts and where they currently operate and if they were only in the inner islands.	SC members clarified that hovercrafts are operating only around Mahe and that the approval for operation at the time was based on the condition that hovercraft do not operate in any MPA. AD.
3.21	Break out group discussions	Objective: Break out groups to discuss issues and develop or propose solutions.	

Agenda Item #	Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
		<p>Discussion topics</p> <p>Zone 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Subsistence Fishing • Sustainability Criteria - Tourism • Hovercraft? • FAD Management and Industrial Tuna Supply Vessels • Area-based management considerations <p>Zone 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sustainability Criteria - Tourism • Petroleum Exploration - how close to islands and atolls* (TWG#14) • Jet skis: cruise ships, marine charters, recreation • Area-based management considerations <p>Zone 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Activities, Conditions • Management Considerations 	
3.220	Plenary based on breakout group	Plenary Discussion after Break Out Groups	
3.221	Subsistence fishing	<p>Members reported that the SFA common fisheries term (as per the definition) is sufficient as it stands as there should be no commercial side to subsistence fisheries (no for resorts/charters/fishing vessels etc).</p> <p>Meaning that for Z1 this should not affect Adabra/D'Arros as these areas do not have a requirement for commercial uses (Only research activities are ongoing). However, this may be an issue for Bird Island due to the resort as there is a commercial aspect. Hence, for Bird, subsistence should not be allowable. Group members expressed that users would need to go outside Z1 into Z2 as it is not far. Group members also felt that the target species (IUCN related species restrictions) for subsistence fisheries can be addressed in the management plans.</p> <p>May need a definition of 'commercial'</p>	
3.222	Subsistence fishing - Recommendations from break out Group	A query was raised with respect to private islands such as Bird island – if the owner has a private residence on the island would subsistence fishing be restricted? Need to consider potential future uses and aspects of management/implementation of the MPA.	It may become difficult to start separating these activities for residence and/or commercial uses. JR
3.223		It was proposed and agreed that if there is a private residence AND commercial uses on the island then subsistence should not occur. Hence, subsistence	

Agenda Item #	Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
		fishing for research /management on Bird would not be allowable if there is a commercial enterprise on the island.	
3.224		Members were reminded that the conditions in the management plan and AAT and when managing activities, there needs to be compliance with existing legislations for enforcement.	There is a need to translate these to the regulations for these areas. HS
3.225		It was pointed out that the definition of who is a resident, benefits of resident(s) and private entities managing an area will need to be clarified. It was recommended that GoS applies the lessons learned from Silhouette MNP.	
3.226		Consideration of policy vs enforcement will also be important. For eg on Aldabra subsistence fishing is allowable, but if there is a rogue staff/island manager, it can become an issue. Hence, monitoring and enforcement of subsistence fishing in remote atolls will be as important.	
3.230	Tourism & sustainability criteria – recommendations from Tourism Group	A recommendation was made that the definition for cruise ships is weak and that the SMSP team should check the definition in merchant shipping act.	JS., HS.
3.231		With respect to the definition for motorised and non-motorised activities, a recommendation was made on whether it should focus on activity or type of vessel? E.g. Motorised craft vs non-motorised craft. There were references made to the SMSA Act for the definition and for alignment of definitions. Personal watercraft vs commercial watercraft use in SMSA Act and recommendation to make the distinction.	SMSP to check the SMSA Act for the definitions. HS., JS.
3.232		Zone 1 – floating structures. Change condition from X to C1, 19	JS., HS.
3.233		Zone 1 -Marine Tourism Accommodation should be changed to an X and SMSP team to check definition.	JS., HS.
3.234		Zone 2- Jet ski allowable with C. Remove or review code 11 or add a new code with explicit remarks about jet ski and other motorised management (code 20 conditional use of jetski). Z1 jet ski not allowed in Z1 (C11).	JS., HS.
3.235		Jet skis are also prohibited in Z2 as currently C11. Need to change this to allowable with conditions – need new code #20.	
3.236		Propose to enlarge definition of jet skis to capture other vessels. Change C11 to add other similar motorised crafts (eg underwater scooters, jet packs, motorised paddle boards etc.).	
3.330	Area-based management-	Z2 – Denis and St Joseph	

Agenda Item #	Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
	recommendations from break out groups	<p>It was recommended by SOSF that St Joseph has its own management boundary in the Amirantes to Fortune Bank Z2 to address the ecological sensitivities around St Joseph. St Joseph has highly endangered species, shallow water habitats & features. There is a need for different conditions for some activities and a co-management authority specific for that area. There have been discussions with the SMSP and GoS on whether it is possible to have areas with their own management boundary within a larger gazetted area. Discussions on AAT and conditions for Denis and St Joseph Z2 are similar with more restrictions on Aquaculture, Fisheries, Fly fishing and recreational activities.</p> <p>Agreement for AAT St Joseph includes: X- commercial fishing and aquaculture C- subsistence, fly, Sport and recreational fishing add 1, 3, 5, 7, 12, 13 and 16 x- renewable energy x non-renewable energy X – commercial bioprospecting X- tourism accommodation terrestrial for St Joseph.</p> <p>Clarifications needed for permits required for bioprospecting.</p>	JS., HS
3..331		SWIOFISH3 representatives requested clarification for the process of developing management boundaries. The Swiofish3 will be developing management plans for three Z2 areas and this may require management boundaries, co-management agreements and mandates for management.	SMSP bringing information to that process. JS.
3.332		It was raised by SeyCCAT that the St Joseph component of the management plan needs to be factored in under the SWIOFISH3 work and that once the management boundary is finalised, these can be included in management plan template and trialled (funded by O5 project).	
3.333		Members were reminded by SWIOFISH3 that the harvest strategy policy will also inform the fishery management units. The harvest strategy describes the process to identify a fishery management unit to inform a fishery management plan.	
3.334		PetroSeychelles expressed that it has no concerns with moving non-renewable energy to an X for St Joseph and Denis.	HS., JS.
3.335		There was confirmation from PetroSeychelles that there are no plans for non-renewable energy for St Joseph.	

Agenda Item #	Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
4.0	Management Units	The discussions on Management units include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Co-management arrangements and terms • Management Considerations within MSP Zone boundary for the Management Plans • Monitoring, Control and Surveillance 	An example of the management unit of St Joseph was presented to the members.
5.0	Plenary on Management Units	The plenary discussions on management units in the SMSP are summarised below.	
5.1		It was highlighted by the SWIOFISH3 that management areas within larger areas (co-management modalities) vs. fishery management units may not align with the MPA. So in Amirantes there may be a fishery management plan (larger) which will feed into the MPA management plan.	
5.2		Concerns were raised as to the importance that the area aligns with the management plan of Amirantes to Fortune Bank and that the AAT align with the zone 2 AAT for the larger area. It is also important to define the co-management arrangements and delegated management/regulations for these areas.	
5.3		A query was raised as to how the management units will be demarcated to enable enforcement. From a management point of view, a legal framework will need to have a demarcation.	Similar to gazetted areas with coordinates. Legal advice from Minister's office in needed. JS.
5.4		The SMSP team confirmed that the EC agreed that the coordinates will be sent to UK HO for reflection on admiralty charts and GPS devices (navionics) once implementation commences.	
5.5		A query was raised as to the expectations of management entities when it comes to control of fishing activities. It was proposed that duties such as powers of arrest should be defined in co-management agreements.	
5.6		A query was raised with respect to fisheries and inclusion in the EPA when it was revised to consider the roles in the co-management of an MPA with respect to fisheries.	There is currently no confirmation that delegation of authority for fisheries will go to the co-manager. JS.
5.7		It was hence re-iterated that co-management arrangements are important to be discussed for the management plan discussions and to move to implementation.	The NRC act includes requirements for co-management agreements. Management plans can also inform the co-management agreements & regulations for the areas. Important that

Agenda Item #	Agenda Item	Comment/Advice	Action_Response (with initials)
			there is no duplication of effort. HS
6.0	Wrap up and next steps	<p>The closing of the meeting included a summary of the next schedule of meetings for July 2022. These include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • TWG #14- spatial decision matrix for oil and gas • MSP Public Information Session - Praslin and La Digue • Bilateral consultations • SC #21, with TWG #15 • EC #27 • Finalise AAT table for Z1, 2 and 3. 	
		Meeting adjourned at 1556hrs.	

Minutes submitted by: Helena Sims on

Annex I: Meeting Agenda

SEYCHELLES MARINE SPATIAL PLAN (MSP) INITIATIVE

MSP Steering Committee, with Technical Working Groups

Steering Committee #20, with Technical Working Group #13

Date: Friday 15th July 2022

Time: 8:30 AM – 4:00 PM

Location: Eden Bleu Hotel, Mahé

DRAFT Agenda

Meeting Objectives:

3. To address key issues on Allowable Activities Tables for Zone 1-3
4. To initiate drafting of Zone Management Units, where needed

#	Time	Topic
	8:30	<i>Arrival and Registration</i>
1	9:00	<p>Meeting Opening – Steering Committee Co-Chair MACCE</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Welcome and Agenda review • Review and Approve Minutes from SC #19

2	9:15	Seychelles MSP: Zoning to Implementation – Dr. Joanna Smith and Ms. Helena Sims i. Summary of zoning items to finalise ii. Q&A
3	9:30	Allowable Activities Tables (AAT) i. Plenary: Review outstanding activities to finalise including: o Subsistence Fishing – Zone 1 o Sustainable Tourism Criteria – Zone 2 o Sustainable Fisheries Criteria – Zone 2 o Area based management considerations o Zone 3 Table(s) ii. Break out group discussions – introduction of objectives for groups
	10:00	COFFEE BREAK
3	10:15	Allowable Activities Tables, cont’d ii. Break out group discussions, cont’d iii. Plenary: Review group discussions to identify (a) areas of agreement and (b) what needs more discussion, information or review
	12:00	LUNCH PROVIDED
4	1:00	MSP Zone Management Units – Dr. Joanna Smith, Mr. Rick Tingey and Ms. Helena Sims i. Plenary: Presentation on Management Units ii. Break out group discussions
	2:30	COFFEE BREAK
5	2:45	MSP Zone Management Units – Dr. Joanna Smith, Mr. Rick Tingey and Ms. Helena Sims i. Break out group discussions ii. Plenary: identify (a) areas of agreement and (b) what needs more discussion, information or review
6	3:45	Wrap up and next steps
	4:00	Adjourn

Annex II: List of documents provided for the meeting.

SEYMSP_SC20_TWG13_Agenda_15Jul2022_draft4
 SEYMSP_ActivitiesTable_Completion_Codes_20220715
 SEYMSP_ActivitiesTable_Completion_GenMgmt_20220715
 SEYMSP_MasterList_AllowableActivities_Map545_20220715
 SEYMSP_ActivitiesTable_Completion_Zone1_20220715
 SEYMSP_ActivitiesTable_Completion_Zone2_20220715
 SEYMSP_ActivitiesTable_Completion_Zone3_20220715

Annex III: MSP SC and TWG participant list

Attendance:

MSP SC:

Ameer Ebrahim	SFA
Chris Mason-Parker	CEO, MCSS - Chairperson, Marine Ecology TWG
Cynthia Adrienne	GIS Section, MLH
Denis Matatiken	Co-Chair PS Environment, MACCE
Elke Talma	SeyCCAT Projects Coordinator
Helena Sims	MSP Project Manager, TNC Africa
Joanna Smith	MSP Science Manager, TNC Canada
Lindsay Chong-Seng	Plant Conservation Action Group – Chair of Terrestrial Ecology TWG
Marie-May Jeremie	CEO, SeyCCAT
Rick Tingey	GIS spatial analyst, Spatial Support Systems LLC
Sylvanna Antat	UniSey
Wilna Accouche	GIF
Abel Sorry	BE

1. Marine Ecology TWG:

Chris Mason-Parker (Chair)	MCSS
Annabelle Constance	SIF
Stuart Laing	UniSey
James Lea	SOSF-DRC
Gilberte Gendron	Independent Consultant- Bee Ecological Consulting
Alain de comarmond	Independent consultant

2. Terrestrial Ecology

Corianna Julie	SIF
Didier Dogley	Independent consultant
Yohan Mendez	

5. Maritime Security

-

4. Energy & Infrastructure- (includes shipping, petroleum and mining)

Patrick Samson (Chair)	PetroSeychelles
------------------------	-----------------

5. Fisheries

Wilna Accouche	GIF
Abel Sorry	Blue Economy Department
Jan Robinson	SWIOFISH3
Rodney Govinden	SFA
Johnny Louys	SFA (CMS)

Ameer Ibrahim SFA

6. Tourism

Bernice Senaratne Tourism Department, Ministry of Tourism & foreign affairs

7. Financing and Implementation

Stefan de Greling SeyCCAT

MSP Core Team

Joanna Smith Science and Process lead, Seychelles MSP initiative, TNC Canada

Helena Sims Project Manager, Seychelles MSP initiative, TNC

Sabrina Renaud MSP Admin Support

Mr. Rick Tingey GIS spatial analyst, Spatial Support Systems LLC

Ms. Elke Talma SeyCCAT Project coordinator